TOOLKIT ON EFFECTIVE MENTORING FOR YOUTH FACING BARRIERS TO SUCCESS

Best practices and resources to build, strengthen, evaluate and sustain effective mentoring programs for youth considered at high-risk of under education, unemployment, homelessness, criminalization, and other negative outcomes.

Ontario Mentoring Coalition
2016
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Moving a project from ‘just a good idea’ to a project that becomes a ‘great resource’ usually requires the support and work of a large group of people. This toolkit - Effective Mentoring for Youth Facing Barriers to Success - is no different. On behalf of the Ontario Mentoring Coalition (OMC) who supported the concept of the project, we have many people to recognize and thank for their ongoing support throughout.

First, a huge thanks must go to the Ontario Ministry of Children and Youth Services for believing in the importance of a resource and training to guide organizations as they develop and implement mentoring programs for youth facing barriers to success. We’d like to thank the Ministry staff for their support and feedback as the project unfolded.

We also want to thank the Advisory Committee for their invaluable contribution. Recognizing the importance of this work, these individuals came together at key points to guide and provide direction on all aspects of the project – the literature review, the toolkit and the training plan. Members of the Advisory Committee included:

- Bruce Rivers (Covenant House)
- Joelle Lewis (Big Brothers Big Sisters of Canada)
- Julie Carter (CAS Sarnia-Lambton)
- Liz O’Neill (Boys and Girls Clubs Big Brothers Big Sisters of Edmonton & Area)
- Sharmaarke Abdullahi (Crime Prevention Ottawa)
- Sonia Prevost-Derbecker (Indspire)
- Tammy Martin (Indspire)
- Beth Malcolm – Co-Chair OMC (Canadian Women’s Foundation)
- Cathy Denyer – Co-Chair OMC (formerly of Big Brothers Big Sisters of Toronto)

Many thanks also go to Alberta Mentoring Partnership (AMP) for being a mentor in every sense of the word to the Ontario Mentoring Coalition. A special thank you is extended to Liz O’Neill (Co-Chair AMP) for her shared vision and Corey Dodge for his technical skills and expertise.

Finally, we want to thank Melanie Bania, Lead Consultant on the project, and Vanessa Chase, Associate Consultant. They more than exceeded our expectations and delivered a solid resource along with training opportunities for organizations desiring to create mentoring programs now and into the future. Thank you for sharing your talents and expertise with this project and more importantly...making it happen.

A special thank you and recognition is extended to the youth of Ontario for ensuring that their voice was heard.
# Table of Contents

## INTRODUCTION
How This Toolkit Was Developed.......................................................................................................................... 6
Youth Input.................................................................................................................................................................. 7
Other Considerations.................................................................................................................................................. 8
Purpose of the Toolkit............................................................................................................................................... 8
Other Project Components....................................................................................................................................... 9
Key Messages of the Toolkit..................................................................................................................................... 10

## TYPES & EFFECTIVENESS FOR YOUTH CONSIDERED 'HIGH-RISK'
- How effective is mentoring for youth who face barriers to success? ................................................................. 10
- How do we know if a young person is a 'good fit' for a mentoring program (including based on their level of 'risk')? ......................................................................................................................... 10
- How can we make our mentoring program the most effective and safe as possible? .......................................... 11
- What do we need to consider when providing mentoring opportunities for youth who face barriers to success? ........................................................................................................................................... 11
- What are the best practices in program management and sustainability planning? ................................................. 12
- Underlying Frameworks & Foundations for Mentoring Youth ........................................................................... 14
- Mentoring Models & Program Types ................................................................................................................... 19
- Mentee-Mentor Relationship Styles ..................................................................................................................... 23
- The Effectiveness of Mentoring for Youth Facing Multiple Barriers to Success ..................................................... 27

## EFFECTIVE PROGRAM COMPONENTS & IMPLEMENTATION
- Recruiting and Selecting Mentees .......................................................................................................................... 33
- Assessing Mentees............................................................................................................................................... 34
- Recruiting Mentors............................................................................................................................................. 36
- Selecting & Screening Mentors............................................................................................................................ 38
- Training Mentees................................................................................................................................................. 41
- Training Mentors.................................................................................................................................................. 43
- Matching & Initiating the Relationship ................................................................................................................ 49
- Developing a Healthy & Safe Mentoring Relationship ........................................................................................ 53
- Supporting, Supervising & Maintaining the Match ............................................................................................... 56
- Involving Parents, Caregivers or Family .................................................................................................................. 60
- Closing the Match & Re-Matching........................................................................................................................ 63
- Celebrating Efforts & Successes............................................................................................................................ 66
What is mentoring?

A mentor is “an experienced and trusted advisor” (Oxford Dictionaries, n.d.). Mentoring is typically when an older and/or more experienced individual acts as a role model for a younger, less experienced person.

What prompted this toolkit?

This toolkit was developed by the Ontario Mentoring Coalition with funds provided by the Ministry of Children and Youth Services of the Province of Ontario. The goal of the toolkit is to provide information and guidance to organizations implementing new mentoring programs for youth who face multiple barriers to success. Mentoring for youth who face multiple barriers to success may require different approaches and strategies to be successful. This toolkit will assist practitioners and organizations to build and strengthen mentoring for diverse youth populations who experience a relatively high level of vulnerability and marginalization.

The contents of the toolkit were modified from the affiliated literature review. The information for the literature review was collected by scanning, reviewing and synthesizing both academic and non-academic literature.

What do we mean by “youth facing multiple barriers to success”?

In general terms, we are referring to youth who are living in harms way; youth who, because of their self-identity, life circumstances and/or life experiences, experience vulnerability and marginalization. The Ministry of Children and Youth Services (MCYS) considers youth facing multiple barriers to success as youth who experience obstacles to full participation in their communities and may benefit from targeted support and opportunities. Based on the definition provided by MCYS², and consultation with the Advisory Committee for this project, the following groups were identified as priorities:
• Youth with academic challenges
• Indigenous youth
• Racialized youth
• Newcomer youth
• Youth with developmental and other disabilities
• Youth with mental health needs
• Lesbian, gay, bisexual, transsexual, transgender, queer, questioning, intersex, pansexual, Two Spirit, and asexual youth
• Youth in or leaving care
• Homeless youth
• Youth involved with the criminal justice system
• Girls

“Some groups of youth have unique circumstances, challenges and needs. These youth may need more targeted supports and opportunities to ensure they are able to succeed” (MCYS, 2013, p. 12)

These are somewhat superficial separations – one youth may identify with more than one of these groups. Nonetheless, they allow us to present the material in an organized way. We invite you to explore the information on mentoring youth that is most applicable to you.

How This Toolkit Was Developed

This toolkit was developed by the Ontario Mentoring Coalition, with funding from the Ministry of Children & Youth Services of the Province of Ontario. The content was prepared by Melanie Bania, PhD and her Associate, Vanessa Chase. The project was enhanced by the guidance of an Advisory Committee of service providers, and input from youth in Ontario facing barriers to success.

Advisory Committee

The Ontario Mentoring Coalition Co-Chairs provided leadership for this project:

• Cathy Denyer, community member representative
• Beth Malcolm, Canadian Women’s Foundation

An Advisory Committee composed of 7 members provided further guidance for this project:
Youth Input

“Let’s say I’m high risk, I don’t know, you’re not supposed to use [that term], and I did some stupid stuff, but I learned at the end of the day people could change. I think that’s one of points of having mentor. Mentorship can make a difference in your life.” (Covenant House Youth Consultation)

Is it important to include the voice of youth in initiatives that are meant to benefit them. This project engaged established youth groups to provide feedback on the resources being developed. Groups of youth were guided through a list of questions on their views of mentoring, and their past experiences. Their views and ideas were then used to enhance the contents of the toolkit.

Youth were engaged in this process in partnership with the following groups / organizations:

- Covenant House, Toronto, ON (10 youth)
- YWCA, Scarborough, ON (7 youth)
- Neptune Renewal Group, Toronto, ON (11 youth)

A total of 28 youth were engaged in this process and provided an honorarium for their time and contributions. These youth were from a variety of backgrounds and represented a wide range of life experiences, including many of the characteristics considered in this toolkit. We also included thoughts and feedback in the toolkit from youth who participated in other youth advisory exercises facilitated by external agencies. These groups include the Big Brothers Big Sister of Canada Youth in Care: Youth Focus Groups and the Provincial Advocate for Children and Youth: Report from the Youth Leaving Care Hearings.
Other Considerations

How we decided on the language to use

We took our lead from youth themselves. Many terms are used to refer to youth who face barriers to success (ex: at-risk youth, high-risk youth, vulnerable youth, marginalized youth, youth with potential, etc.). It is difficult to find one term that resonates positively with everyone and that everyone can agree with. Above all else, we do not want to further stigmatize and marginalize youth. Therefore, we chose to refer to 'youth who face barriers to success', which highlights both their experiences and their relationship with the outside world.

How we decided on the resources to include

The information on mentoring is plentiful. A simple internet search can bring up hundreds of thousands of hits. Luckily, there are organizations, partnerships, coalitions, and respected researchers that produce well-developed, well-documented rigorous material on effective mentoring. We sought the most recent, most relevant, and user-friendly resources and tools to share in this toolkit. Many resources may exist on any given topic; in those cases, we chose to include the ones we felt were most readily available, user-friendly and practical for use by service providers.

Purpose of the Toolkit

"Mentoring can be really helpful for youth who don’t have positive or valuable role models in their lives. [Try] your best not to frame it as a “program”, no one likes being treated like a problem that needs to be “mentored”. Obviously targeting [particular] groups and demographics is necessary, but try the best to obscure it. Keep it confidential (beyond what the law requires).” (Covenant House Youth Consultation)

WHO is the toolkit for?

- Mentoring program staff and managers
- Adults working with youth facing barriers
- Community organizations
- Mentors
- Researchers
- Funders
WHAT is the purpose of the toolkit?

- To share key information and resources for developing, implementing, evaluating and sustaining effective mentoring initiatives for youth facing multiple barriers to success
- To provide access to a variety of resources in one convenient place

WHERE can the toolkit be accessed?

- The toolkit can be accessed both online and in PDF format that can be printed

WHY utilize the toolkit?

- To help ensure that mentoring is rooted in best practices
- To help increase the likelihood that vulnerable youth involved in mentoring programs experience safe relationships and positive results

HOW can the toolkit be used?

- To support the development, expansion, and enhancement of mentoring for youth based on best practices
- To gain knowledge to better serve mentees facing multiple barriers
- To provide tools for mentors to enhance their practice
- To enhance results for vulnerable youth
- To access consolidated literature in mentoring youth facing multiple barriers to success

Other Project Components

For more in-depth information or exploration of the topics in this toolkit, see the finalized Literature Review.

Online training webinars, tools and handouts can be downloaded from:
http://ontariomentoringcoalition.ca/mentoringyouthfacingbarriers/key-resources-webinars/
Key Messages of the Toolkit

How effective is mentoring for youth who face barriers to success?

For young people in general, research shows that formal mentoring program models (community-based mentoring, group mentoring, and cross-age peer mentoring) that develop strong mentoring relationships over at least one year can yield positive effects for mentees. Studies show small, modest positive outcomes for youth in mentoring that are comparable to other similar, well-developed formal interventions with youth. These outcomes relate to positive academic, emotional, behavioural and social development. *To be effective, a mentoring relationship must be strong, consistent, and last at least one year.*

The evidence is less common, conclusive or definitive for the overall effectiveness of mentoring for youth deemed at higher-risk of negative life outcomes. The first large-scale, rigorous study of how varying youth ‘risk profiles’ affect a mentoring relationship and outcomes was conducted by Herrera, DuBois and Grossman in 2013. The study reveals that:

- Mentoring can benefit youth with various ‘risk profiles’. Youth with different levels and types of ‘risk profiles’ had mentoring relationships that were similar in strength and in duration, and experienced similar positive benefits from participating in mentoring. However, there were somewhat stronger and more consistent benefits for youth who scored relatively high on individual risk factors (challenging attitudes and behaviours, academic struggles, significant health needs, involvement in the justice system) but not on environmental risk factors (e.g., poverty, unsafe housing, low parental support).
- The challenges reported by mentors and the reasons matches ended prematurely differed in relation to the youth’s risk profile.

For more detailed information, go to the section on [the effectiveness of mentoring for various sub-populations of youth](#).

How do we know if a young person is a ‘good fit’ for a mentoring program (including based on their level of ‘risk’)?

*The most important factor is whether or not the young person is open to making a long-term commitment to form a relationship with a mentor.* Research shows that young people who decide for themselves (‘self-select’) to participate in a mentoring program yield the most benefit. The young person must be open to trying to connect with a new person in their life.
Recent research suggests that mentoring programs may be less effective if they try to support youth who experience relatively high levels of individual risk factors (challenging attitudes and behaviours, academic struggles, significant health needs, involvement in the justice system), AND environmental risk factors (e.g., poverty, unsafe housing, low parental support).

To be effective, a mentoring relationship must be strong, consistent, and last at least one year. It is important for service providers to consider whether an individual youth can commit to that within their current life circumstances.

**How can we make our mentoring program the most effective and safe as possible?**

There are a number of well-established standards and best practices for planning and implementing an effective mentoring program. It is important to consult and consider [Effective Mentoring Program Components and Implementation](#). These relate to everything from selecting, screening, and training participants, to successfully closing a match relationship.

**What do we need to consider when providing mentoring opportunities for youth who face barriers to success?**

There are additional considerations when mentoring youth who face barriers to success.

*Facilitating transformative mentoring relationships*

To be effective, the mentoring relationship must go beyond providing assistance with tasks and goals, and must take a more transformative mentoring approach.

*Recognizing and addressing the dynamics of power and privilege*

Youth facing multiple barriers to success may feel especially disempowered given their past life experiences. Rather than gloss over or ignore issues of power and privilege, it is important for service providers, mentors, and youth themselves to [acknowledge the role that power and privilege plays in their lives and relationships](#).

*Providing trauma-informed services*

Youth facing multiple barriers to success may have experienced considerable trauma. Refer to the [Trauma Informed Practice Guide](#) for more information about recognizing and responding to trauma-related issues with youth.
Tailoring the program to meet the specific strengths and needs of youth

There are various considerations to keep in mind when mentoring youth with different life experiences. There are best practices for Tailored Mentoring for Youth with Specific Needs. There are also interactive activities that you can facilitate with program staff, mentors and mentees themselves to explore the unique strengths and needs of each youth. One of these activities is called Body Mapping.

What are the best practices in program management and sustainability planning?

Just like there are evidence-informed practices in program implementation, there are also a number of best practices in program management and sustainability planning. These include:

- ensuring ongoing resource development and diversifying funding
- building and maintaining effective partnerships
- ensuring effective leadership and staff development
- fostering community buy-in and participation
- maximizing quality and evaluating results
- prioritizing good communication and visibility

How can we build our capacity for program evaluation?

Service providers are increasingly being required to evaluate their programs. Organizations are increasingly becoming interested in evidence-informed management and services, as a way of maximizing their impact and demonstrating their results. This toolkit provides information on output monitoring, process evaluation, and outcome evaluation. By exploring the section on Program Evaluation, Learning & Improvement, you will learn strategies for developing your own evaluation for mentoring programs for youth facing multiple barriers to success.
In this section, the types and effectiveness of mentoring for youth facing barriers will be explored.

There are a few key, theoretical frameworks that provide the philosophical and scientific underpinnings for current thinking and practice in youth mentoring.

- **Prevention Science** is a theory based on helping prevent individual risk factors and supporting development of protective factors.
- **Positive Youth Development** theory acknowledges the inherent worth of individuals and supports them in developing their assets.
- **A Strength-Based Approach** emphasizes an individual’s strengths and ability to change their own life circumstances.

Mentoring programs can utilize various models. The traditional model popularized by Big Brother Big Sisters, where an older person mentors one young person, is considered formal mentoring whereas a less structured relationship with no formal matching process are typically considered informal mentoring.

There are also various mentoring relationship styles, which will define how a program is developed and implemented. Although Developmental and Instrumental Mentoring both take a mentee-centred approach, instrumental mentoring focuses more on setting and achieving goals, while developmental mentoring places emphasis on building the relationship first. Whichever relationship style is used, the literature recommends Transformative Mentoring when working with youth experiencing higher needs. In transformative mentoring relationships, mentors operate from a youth-centred approach, are willing to go ‘above and beyond’ to build trust, and are persistent and reflective in their roles.

Finally, it is important to understand the general Effectiveness of Mentoring for Youth. Much of the literature has found that formal mentoring programs that build strong relationships can elicit positive outcomes for the mentees, however effectiveness for youth facing particular barriers varies.
Underlying Frameworks & Foundations for Mentoring Youth

"It’s like a mutual relationship. So, like, you get advice from her, that doesn’t mean you can’t give them advice." (Covenant House Youth Consultation)

Prevention Science

Prevention science is based on the central idea that people may have risk factors that can lead to negative outcomes. If risk factors are addressed and protective factors are enhanced, mental health issues and problem behaviours can be prevented (Cavell & Elledge, 2014; Keller, 2007). Mentoring is justified as a prevention strategy based on social control theory by suggesting that when people build meaningful connections with mentors, they gain protective factors and limit risk factors. Some have argued that mentoring is only effective as a context for other types of interventions, where positive relationships provide a good environment for targeting other specific ‘risk’ behaviours. Proponents suggest that it is important to design the program around specific risk and protective factors and include research as a component to help enhance the justification for future prevention-based mentoring programs (Cavell & Elledge, 2014).

Prevention Science as outlined by Cavell and Elledge (2014) requires the following steps:

- A theoretical justification of the cause (risk factor) and effect (development of protective factors/ reduced risk factors);
- Addressing how the intervention will target the specified risk and protective factors to lead to the desired outcome;
- A strategy for determining the most appropriate target population;
- Implementing the program before the risk factors influence more negative outcomes for individuals, so that they can have a meaningful impact; and
- Targeting general risk and protective factors to achieve more positive outcomes with different people.

Positive Youth Development

Positive Youth Development theory puts forth that because young people have greater capacity to change their behaviours and mental health than adults, they have an enhanced ability to build skills to be successful (Lerner, Brittain, & Fay, 2007; Lerner, Napolitano, Boyd, Mueller, & Callina, 2014). Positive Youth Development takes into account the assets people have and ones they can develop to enhance lifelong outcomes. Mentoring programs that are successfully oriented to the Positive Youth Development framework utilize the “Big 3” features of youth development to design their programs. These features entail helping youth to:

1. Create a relationship with a positive and consistent adult,
2. Learn life skills, and
Resiliency Initiatives (2012) identified the following traits, which contribute to the positive development of children and youth:

- Building and maintaining social relationships
- Coping with stress
- Problem solving
- Being responsible for oneself and as part of a team
- Having and acting with a set of values
- Setting goals and having confidence about the future
- Developing and practicing emotional intelligence
- Being motivated and having perseverance
- Defining a passion or interests
- Having spiritual connection and awareness

As outlined by Lerner, Brittain, and Fay (2007), mentors can actively support positive youth development for their mentees by focusing on the 6 C’s:

- **Competence** – Mentors help youth discover their skills, understand how their skills can be transferable, and support them in learning from their mistakes.
- **Confidence** – It is important for mentees to build a network of support and skills to solve problems in their own lives. Mentors can assist by providing mentees referrals to other agencies and by helping role model problem solving personal challenges.
- **Connection** – Mentors should respect their mentees’ privacy and help them connect and feel heard in the community.
- **Character** – By role modeling appropriate actions, allowing youth to make their own decisions, and explaining why certain actions are appropriate or inappropriate mentors can help mentees develop character.
- **Caring** – Even during difficult times, mentors should show sincere compassion for their mentees and also help them learn the benefit of caring for others.
- **Contribution** – Once youth have developed the first five C’s, they may have the capacity to help others. Mentors should encourage mentees to give back to their communities when they are ready.

The Search Institute (1997 & 2007) utilized the assets above and the developmental stages of children and youth to create a research-base tool called the **40 Developmental Assets**. This can be used by adult supporters or youth themselves to identify positive qualities, areas of strength and gaps in order to help guide future directions and interventions.
Strengths-Based Approaches

A strengths-based approach focuses on identifying and building a youth’s strengths, as opposed to the common approach of viewing young people as having problems that need to be fixed (Hammond & Zimmerman, 2012). The strengths-based approach views problems as separate from the person. When people are viewed as capable, they are able to draw on current assets and learn new skills to manage their own wellbeing in sustainable ways (Cox, 2008; Hammond & Zimmerman, 2012). Taken another way, a strengths-based approach can help people feel hopeful and develop resiliency in the face of obstacles (Alberta Mentoring Partnership, 2010d; Cox, 2008).

A strengths-based approach aligns well with mentoring when intentionally applied to all work of the program. Mentoring staff and mentors can apply a strengths-based approach by:

1) Actively listening and engaging mentees in a feedback loop, where communication is reciprocal;
2) Adapting activities to suit mentees needs;
3) Approaching challenges with a positive lens; and

A strengths-based approach positions supporters as partners rather than professionals, who use genuine support strategies to act as “facilitators of change” in partnership with the individual (Hammond & Zimmerman, 2012). Both the mentor and mentee should view the relationship as one that provides reciprocal benefits, allowing people to recognize and value each others’ inherent power for self-determination (Big Brothers Big Sisters of Fraser Valley, n.d.). The mentor role is to guide mentees, while also allowing the mentees opportunities to learn from experiences of challenge and vulnerability in their own lives (Alberta Mentoring Partnership, 2010d; Big Brothers Big Sisters of Fraser Valley, n.d.).

“Those who embrace the strength-based approach have the privilege of walking along side those they are working with in supporting the exploration, realization, and expression of ‘greatness’” (Alberta Mentoring Partnership, 2010b, p. 20).

The graph below shows some of the main differences between a strengths-based approach versus more deficit or risk-based models (Alberta Mentoring Partnership, 2010b).
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strength-Based Concepts</th>
<th>Deficit-Based Concepts</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>At-potential</td>
<td>At-risk</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strengths</td>
<td>Problems</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Engage</td>
<td>Intervene</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Persistent</td>
<td>Resistant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Understand</td>
<td>Diagnose</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity</td>
<td>Crisis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Celebrate (i.e. successes)</td>
<td>Punish (i.e. non-compliance)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Time-in</td>
<td>Time-out</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adapt to</td>
<td>Reform</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Empower</td>
<td>Control</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Process-focused</td>
<td>Behaviour-focused</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dynamic</td>
<td>Static</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Movement</td>
<td>Epidemic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unique</td>
<td>Deviant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Avoids imposition</td>
<td>Dominant knowledge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Validates people’s experience</td>
<td>Diagnosis based on norms</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>People’s context is primary</td>
<td>Professional’s context is primary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Identifies and builds on strengths</td>
<td>Minimizes people’s strengths</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Client-centred</td>
<td>Mandate-focused</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professionals adapt to clients</td>
<td>Clients expected to adapt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meet clients in their environment</td>
<td>Clients always go to professionals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Flexible</td>
<td>Rigid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Focus on potential</td>
<td>Focus on problems</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>People are inherently social/good</td>
<td>People are inherently selfish/bad</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>People do the best they can</td>
<td>People do as little as possible</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Support</td>
<td>Fix</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Authentic relationship focused</td>
<td>Expert oriented</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inclusive</td>
<td>Exclusive</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The following principles can support any organization or program in utilizing a strengths-based approach (Hammond & Zimmerman, 2012):

- Belief in a person's abilities to affect change in their own lives.
- Belief that challenges are inevitable and can help people build strengths.
- Language can alter people's perceptions of situations and create realities.
- Authentic and unconditional relationships are the crux of helping people build capacity.
- People are experts in their own lives.
- Supporting people to work toward self-determined goals can help them build confidence.
- Personal development is an ongoing process.
- Difference makes us stronger and can help people develop effective communities of support.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Key Resources on Strength-Based Approaches</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Dr. Wayne Hammond Strength-Based Practice Presentation:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Strength-Based Community Mentoring Workbook:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Resiliency Initiatives:</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Mentoring Models & Program Types

Informal Mentoring

Instances of mentoring can occur through short-term and unstructured 'mentoring moments', or more structured, longer-term relationships, such as (Connected Mentor, 2014):

- **natural mentors**: where youth are exposed to persons who act as mentors in their natural environment (e.g., school bus drivers or community volunteers);

- **content mentors**: where youth have brief, content-based interaction with a trusted person they look up to (e.g., guest speakers); and

- **program mentors**: where youth are exposed to a mentor through a structured program (e.g., a homework club or summer camp).
Formal Mentoring

Formal mentoring occurs in a context where there is an intentional mentoring arrangement. MENTOR (2015, p. 9) offers this definition: “Mentoring takes place between young persons (i.e., mentees) and older or more experienced persons (i.e., mentors) who are acting in a non-professional helping capacity to provide relationship-based support that benefits one or more areas of the mentee’s development.”

There are various models of formal mentoring. The table below describes some of the most common types of formal mentoring.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TRADITIONAL ONE-TO-ONE</th>
<th>TEAM MENTORING</th>
<th>GROUP MENTORING</th>
<th>PEER MENTORING</th>
<th>E-MENTORING</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>DESCRIPTION</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>One adult to one young person.</td>
<td>Several adults working with small groups of young people (adult-to-youth ratio not greater than 1:4).</td>
<td>One adult to up to four young people.</td>
<td>Caring youth mentoring other youth.</td>
<td>Mentoring via e-mail and the Internet (ex: social media).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WHERE MENTORING TAKES PLACE</td>
<td>TRADITIONAL ONE-TO-ONE</td>
<td>TEAM MENTORING</td>
<td>GROUP MENTORING</td>
<td>PEER MENTORING</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Agency-based</strong>: At a community agency, typically an after-school program (e.g., youth centre).</td>
<td><strong>Agency-based</strong>: At a community agency, typically an after-school program (e.g., youth centre).</td>
<td><strong>Agency-based</strong>: At a community agency, typically an after-school program (e.g., youth centre).</td>
<td><strong>Agency-based</strong>: At a community agency, typically an after-school program (e.g., youth centre).</td>
<td><strong>School-based</strong>: At the mentee’s school in full view of school officials. Mentors and mentees should have a designated meeting place within the building and/or use of available facilities (open classroom, computer lab, gym, art room, library).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Community-based</strong>: The mentors and mentees can meet anywhere, including attending events, going to museums, etc.</td>
<td><strong>Community-based</strong>: The mentors and mentees can meet anywhere, including attending events, going to museums, etc.</td>
<td><strong>Community-based</strong>: The mentors and mentees can meet anywhere, including attending events, going to museums, etc.</td>
<td><strong>Community-based</strong>: The mentors and mentees can meet anywhere, including attending events, going to museums, etc.</td>
<td><strong>Conducted via the Internet</strong>, as an independent program or as an additional component of existing programs. Need to have technology in place that provides a safe and secure environment for communication exchanges, archives all messages, and enables the tracking of communications between mentoring pairs.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Faith-based</strong>: Mentoring pairs usually meet in a house of worship or adjoining building.</td>
<td><strong>Faith-based</strong>: Mentoring teams usually meet in a house of worship or adjoining building.</td>
<td><strong>Faith-based</strong>: Mentoring teams usually meet in a house of worship or adjoining building.</td>
<td><strong>Faith-based</strong>: Mentoring groups usually meet in a house of worship or adjoining building.</td>
<td><strong>Online</strong>: E-mentoring is a mentoring relationship that is conducted via the Internet.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Online</strong>: E-mentoring is a mentoring relationship that is conducted via the Internet.</td>
<td><strong>Online</strong>: E-mentoring is a mentoring relationship that is conducted via the Internet.</td>
<td><strong>Online</strong>: E-mentoring is a mentoring relationship that is conducted via the Internet.</td>
<td><strong>Online</strong>: E-mentoring is a mentoring relationship that is conducted via the Internet.</td>
<td><strong>Online</strong>: E-mentoring is a mentoring relationship that is conducted via the Internet.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>School-based</strong>: At the mentee’s school in full view of school officials. Mentors and mentees should have a designated meeting place within the building and/or use of available</td>
<td><strong>School-based</strong>: At the mentee’s school in full view of school officials. Mentors and mentees should have a designated meeting place within the building and/or use of available</td>
<td><strong>School-based</strong>: At the mentee’s school in full view of school officials. Mentors and mentees should have a designated meeting place within the building and/or use of available</td>
<td><strong>School-based</strong>: At the mentee’s school in full view of school officials. Mentors and mentees should have a designated meeting place within the building and/or use of available</td>
<td><strong>Online</strong>: E-mentoring is a mentoring relationship that is conducted via the Internet.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TRADITIONAL ONE-TO-ONE</td>
<td>TEAM MENTORING</td>
<td>GROUP MENTORING</td>
<td>PEER MENTORING</td>
<td>E-MENTORING</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>school facilities (open classroom, computer lab, gym, art room, library).</td>
<td>school facilities (open classroom, computer lab, gym, art room, library).</td>
<td>school facilities (open classroom, computer lab, gym, art room, library).</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Workplace-based:</strong> At the mentor’s workplace. Students are typically bussed to the site, which is paid for by the school district or the company. Mentors and mentees should have a designated meeting space at the workplace.</td>
<td><strong>Workplace-based:</strong> At the mentor’s workplace. Students are typically bussed to the site, which is paid for by the school district or the company. Mentors and mentees should have a designated meeting space at the workplace.</td>
<td><strong>Workplace-based:</strong> At the mentors’ workplace. Students are typically bussed to the site. Either the school district or the company may pay for the bus. Mentors and mentees should have a designated meeting place at the workplace.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Adapted from MENTOR, n.d.)
Mentee-Mentor Relationship Styles

Mentors can make youth feel safe by:

- Providing constructive criticism instead of blaming when a mentee makes a mistake
- Using humour
- Modifying their approach for the individual (appealing to their interests and learning styles)
- Showing genuine caring
- Keeping the mentee’s situation confidential
- Building trust slowly being consistent

(Covenant House, Youth Arts Action Group, and YWCA Youth Consultations)

Developmental and Instrumental Relationship Styles

The two mentoring styles that are the most recommended for their effectiveness are developmental and instrumental approaches (Karcher & Hansen, 2014; MENTOR, 2015). Both styles are youth-focused and collaborative, and emphasize relationship building and goal setting. The difference between them is in how they prioritize the early or main focus of the mentoring relationship (MENTOR, 2015):

- **Developmental approaches**: focus on relational activities first to foster and develop a relationship of trust, before potentially incorporating skill building activities and focus.

- **Instrumental approaches**: focus on goal-directed and skill-building activities first, and then turn their attention to developing the interpersonal relationship.

“Research suggests that the provision of structure in the relationship should not be at the expense of a primary focus on having fun and developing the relationship” (MENTOR, 2015, p. 42)

Transformative Mentoring Style for Youth considered ‘Higher-Risk’

When considering the needs of youth deemed higher-risk, there is another classification of mentoring relationship types that is useful and very important to consider. It differentiates between assistance mentoring and transformative mentoring - see the table below for more details on each approach. Research shows that for youth facing multiple barriers, transformative mentoring is more likely to be effective.\(^3\)
In transformative mentoring, mentors are:

- extremely caring and committed;
- willing to go above and beyond casual involvement in a young person's life;
- very patient and willing to play a variety of roles (guide, support, resource, advocate, challenger, etc.);
- willing to meet the young person “where they're at”, both in terms of physical location and mental state;
- culturally and gender competent and aware of current youth issues;
- thoughtful and reflective about their attitudes, activities and techniques;
- skilled in assisting with relevant goals/objectives areas;
- very respectful of other people’s challenges and ways of life; and
- willing to remain a support and an advocate for the youth even when they continue to make mistakes.3

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of Mentoring</th>
<th>Mentoring Efforts &amp; Activities</th>
<th>Youth Profiles</th>
<th>Mentoring Classification</th>
<th>Needed Mentor Characteristics</th>
<th>Mentor Program Considerations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>ASSISTANCE MENTORING</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low Intensity</td>
<td>• Companionship • Academic tutoring • Education guidance • Career/professional guidance</td>
<td>• Well-guided, but could benefit from additional companionship and/or assistance • Very impressionable and eager for assistance</td>
<td>Assistance Mentoring: to assist youth who have no attitudinal and behavioural issues that would inhibit or be an obstacle to receiving basic assistance.</td>
<td>• Caring and committed • Recognizes the value of companionship and guidance to a young person • Little patience, but must commit time • Thought must be given to appropriate attitudes, activities and techniques</td>
<td>Coordinator: • Strong program development &amp; management skills • Strong people skills • Knowledgeable in youth development Program capacity: • Adequate resources Matching: • Same culture and gender matching can be considered but not necessary • Mentors must have skills to assist in particular goal areas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moderate Intensity</td>
<td>Assistance mentoring: Same as above</td>
<td>TRANSFORMATIVE MENTORING</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Companionship</td>
<td>• Well-guided, but could benefit</td>
<td>• Extremely caring and</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Academic</td>
<td>from additional companionship and/</td>
<td>committed</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>tutoring</td>
<td>or assistance</td>
<td>• Willingness to go beyond</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Education</td>
<td>• May or may not have consistent</td>
<td>casual involvement in a</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>guidance</td>
<td>and/or adequate adult</td>
<td>young person’s life</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Career/</td>
<td>companionship or guidance</td>
<td>• Culturally sensitive</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>professional</td>
<td>• Is average or below average on</td>
<td>and willing to come to</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>guidance</td>
<td>academics</td>
<td>where the youth functions,</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Self-esteem</td>
<td>• Have given little or no thought</td>
<td>both physically and</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>building</td>
<td>to education/career path</td>
<td>mentally</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Perspective</td>
<td>• Very impressionable, open to</td>
<td>• Much thought must be</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>broadening</td>
<td>assistance</td>
<td>given to appropriate</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>attitudes, activities</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>and techniques</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Matching: • Same culture and gender matching may be more relevant and should be considered

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Intensive</th>
<th>Transformative mentoring: Designed to affect change in negative self-esteem, attitudes and behaviours in youth who have been profoundly</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Companionship</td>
<td>• No positive guidance or encouragement at home</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Academic</td>
<td>• Not engaged in school</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>tutoring</td>
<td>• Has given little or no thought to education or</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Education</td>
<td>• Caring and committed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>guidance</td>
<td>• Willingness to go beyond casual involvement in a young person’s life</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Career/</td>
<td>• Patient and willing to play several roles (guide, support, resource, teacher, challenger)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>professional</td>
<td>Coordinator: • Strong program development &amp; management skills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>guidance</td>
<td>• Exceptional knowledge in youth development and respect for others’ way of life</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Self-esteem</td>
<td>Program capacity: • Adequate resources</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Very Intensive | • Companionship  
• Academic tutoring  
• Education guidance  
• Career/professional guidance  
• Self-esteem building  
• Perspective broadening  
• Conflict resolution  
• Responsibility  
• Respect for others  
• Respect for self | • Still reachable but hard to engage  
• Little to no positive adult influence, guidance or support  
• Attracted to the “easy way out”  
• Very influenced by peers  
• Has spent considerable time institutionalized | Same as above | • Extremely caring and committed, may become a surrogate family member  
• Always in touch and on call  
• Patient and loving  
• Willingness to come to where the youth functions, both physically and mentally  
• Much thought must be given to appropriate attitudes, activities and techniques  
• Culturally sophisticated and abreast of youth issues  
• Willing to remain an advocate for the young person even when they continue to make mistakes | Same as above | • Strong collaborative relationships with community partners  
• Strong and relevant follow-up services in place for youth | Matching:  
• Same culture and gender matching should be strongly considered  
• Mentors must have skills to assist in particular goal areas  
• Mentors must be culturally/gender competent and very respectful of others’ challenges and way of life |
Mentors can also utilize a **growth mindset** to facilitate intensive mentoring with mentees facing significant barriers by working with their mentees to overcome personal, academic, and social challenges in a positive way. One resource mentors can use to support mentees in overcoming personal, academic, and social challenges is called the **Mindset Kit**. This toolkit offers lessons, videos, and resources mentors can employ to provide a more transformative mentoring experience for their mentees.

**The Effectiveness of Mentoring for Youth Facing Multiple Barriers to Success**

> "Don't tell youth they are high-risk, even “youth” is patronizing. Participants is ideal." (Covenant House Youth Consultation)

**Overall findings including for different ‘risk profiles’**

For young people in general, research shows that common formal mentoring program models (community-based mentoring, group mentoring, and cross-age peer mentoring) that develop strong mentoring relationships can yield positive effects for mentees. Meta-analyses report small, modest positive outcomes for youth comparable to other similar, well-developed formal interventions with youth (DuBois et al., 2011). These outcomes relate to positive academic, emotional, behavioural and social development, including (Davis & Fagans, n.d.; DuBois et al., 2002 & 2011; Rhodes & DuBois, 2006; Wheeler, Keller, & DuBois, 2010):

- increasing confidence, healthy self-esteem and respect in mentees;
- developing more positive attitudes, values and beliefs;
- developing the capacity to see other options and to make positive choices;
- promoting more pro-social behaviour;
- improving emotional well-being;
- improving attendance in school and academic achievement in some areas;
- developing the ability to think constructively and positively about the future; and
- defining short- and longer-term goals.
There are also benefits for mentors, which can include (Davis & Fagans, n.d.):

- the satisfaction of being useful to someone else;
- the pleasure from contributing to positive change in the mentee;
- improved listening, communication and leadership skills;
- better understanding of young people and the problems they face;
- the satisfaction of making a difference;
- personal growth through relating across economic, social, cultural, and personal differences; and
- the recognition and gratitude of teachers, staff, and parents.

The evidence is less common, conclusive or definitive for the overall effectiveness of mentoring for youth deemed at higher-risk of negative life outcomes. The first large-scale, rigorous study of how varying youth risk profiles affect a mentoring relationship and outcomes was conducted by Herrera, DuBois and Grossman in 2013.

The study reveals that:

- Youth with different levels and types of risk profiles had mentoring relationships that were similar in strength and in duration, and experienced similar positive benefits from participating in mentoring.
- The challenges reported by mentors and the reasons matches ended prematurely differed in relation to the youth’s risk profile.
- The strongest and most consistent benefit for youth regardless of their risk profile was a reduction in symptoms of depression (where almost 25% of youth reported depressive symptoms at intake). Noteworthy improvements were also made across risk profiles in social acceptance, academic attitudes and grades.
- There was a trend toward somewhat stronger and more consistent benefits for youth who were relatively high on individual risk but not on environmental risk.
- No significant improvements were found across risk profiles in the areas of positive or negative behaviours, and relationships with parents.
- Mentors with early match training and consistent match support throughout the program met more often with their mentee, and had longer-lasting mentoring relationships. Mentees’ ratings of the quality of their mentoring relationship also coincided with the level of training their mentor had received.

Finally, the researchers suggest that mentoring programs may be most effective when they support youth who experience relatively high levels of individual risk (challenging behaviours, academic struggle, significant health needs), but it may be less effective when supporting both individual and environmental risk factors (e.g., poverty, unsafe housing, low parental support).
The Effectiveness of Mentoring for:

- **Youth with Academic Challenges**
  There are conflicting results about the impact of mentoring for youth with academic challenges, perhaps due to the fact that most mentoring that has been evaluated focuses on relationships as opposed to academics. However, various studies have found positive (low to moderate) impacts on academic outcomes resulting from mentoring interventions (i.e., achievement and drop-out) (The Indiana Youth Institute, 2013). Many researchers have pointed out that relationship building can lead to positive results in other areas of the young person's life.

Mentoring for youth with academic challenges should begin with a relationship NOT academic support/ tutoring (Cannata, et al., 2005; Larose & Tarabulsy, 2013).

- **Youth In or Leaving Care**
  Adequate mentoring can have many positive outcomes for youth in or leaving care, including reduced mental health symptoms and more stable living environments (Garringer, 2011; Taussig & Culhane, 2010). Systematic research is minimal in this area, but interest in mentoring for youth in or leaving care is growing.

  Program staff and mentors should work hard to sustain matches because early match termination is a high risk for youth with transient lifestyles and experiences of abuse, such as youth in or leaving care (Britner, Randall, & Ahrens, 2014).

- **Youth Involved with the Criminal Justice System**
  Research is promising but not conclusive on the impacts of mentoring for youth involved in the criminal justice system (The Indiana Youth Institute, 2013). One systematic review found moderate positive outcomes overall for mentoring programs on the prevention of youth aggression, drug use, and criminalization (Tolan, et al., 2008; Tolan et al., 2014). Another systematic review found that when mentoring was offered in combination with other re-entry supports, re-offending rates for youth following release were somewhat lower (small to moderate effect) (Abrams, et al., 2014; Miller, et al., 2012a; Tolan, et al., 2008; Tolan et al, 2014; Waller, Houchins, & Nomvete, 2010).

  Further research is required to determine:
  - Whether mentoring is effective at reducing criminalization as a stand-alone strategy or as a part of a larger strategy with other interventions (employment, counseling, and/or tutoring) requires further research; and
  - At which stage of youth involvement in the criminal justice system mentoring is most effective (i.e., pre-arrest, diversion, post-arrest, reintegration) (The Indiana Youth Institute, 2013).

- **Youth with Mental Health Needs**
  There is limited research in the field of mentoring for youth with mental health needs. In the literature that exists, mentoring was found to be a promising intervention when supported by a mental health team (Leahy & Robb, 2013). Some research has found that youth with mental health needs with a mentor are more likely to become involved with, successfully participate, and stay in treatment (Kerr & King, 2013).
Mentors are not mental health professionals, although they may need to assist in times of crisis. Thus, they should receive rigorous training in crisis response and have information about resources in the community to refer the mentee (Munson, et al., 2015).

- **Newcomer Youth**
  Mentoring can provide positive social relationships and help the young person integrate into their new culture and decrease negative mental health symptoms (Birman, et al., 2007; Yeh, et al., 2007).

- **Youth with Substance Use Issues**
  There is promising evidence that mentoring can have modest effects on the prevention of youth substance use. However, best practices in this area are less clear. Some research suggests that where community-based mentoring occurred for more than 12 months, there was a direct impact on reducing the frequency of substance use, improvements in how adolescents perceived their relationships with their parents, improvements in peer relationships, and higher youth self-worth (The Indiana Youth Institute, 2013).

- **Youth with Developmental and Other Disabilities**
  Mentoring can help normalize a disability, which may not only help the young person feel more able, but also help them develop a positive disability identity (Axelrod, Campbell, & Holt, 2005; Bell, 2012; Burgstahler, 2012; Garringer, et al., 2015; Journey & Loukas, 2009; Powers, Sowers, & Stevens, 1995; Shem, et al., 2011).

  One promising strategy for youth with disabilities is online mentoring as it may be a safer, more accessible place to connect (Axelrod, Campbell, & Holt, 2005; Burgstahler, 2012; Snowden, 2003).

  Matching youth with disabilities to mentors with similar disabilities can assist the mentee in learning skills for self-efficacy and independent living.

- **Homeless Youth**
  There is minimal information available about mentoring with homeless youth. Similarly, there are conflicting results about its impact (Bartle-Haring, Slesnick, N., Collins, Erdem, & Buettnner, 2012; Dang, Conger, Breslau, & Miller, 2014; Greenlee, Henson, Jones, Vance, & Wilson, 2013; Stewart, Reutter, & Letourneau, 2007). These results may be due to the fact that it is more difficult to sustain formal mentoring with young people living transient lifestyles and thus the mentoring relationship may not have adequate time to develop and elicit positive results (Karabanow & Clement, 2004).

- **Indigenous Youth**
  The effectiveness of mentoring for Indigenous youth has not been studied in-depth. However, a few elements have been found to make mentoring more successful for Indigenous youth, including: focusing on natural mentoring instead of formalized matching; using a small group mentoring approach instead of one-on-one matching; ensuring cultural appropriateness of program activities; and finally matching based on similarities and respect for differences (Klinck, et al., 2005; Sinclair & Pooyak, 2007; Ware, 2013).
• **Racialized Youth**
Mentoring for racialized youth targeting academic challenges has been found to have multiple positive effects. Following a school-based mentoring intervention, racialized youth had better grades and greater perceived teacher support, school belonging, decision making, and were less likely to be involved with school disciplinary system (Gordon, Iwamoto, Ward, Potts, & Boyd, 2009; Holt, Bry, & Johnson, 2008). Cross- or same-race matching can make a significant difference of outcomes, although the research is conflicting. Mentees in cross-race matches were less likely to begin using alcohol than those in same-race matches, yet boys in same-race matches had better educational competence and self-esteem than those in cross-race matches (Rhodes, Reddy, Grossman, & Lee, 2002).

• **LGBTQQIP2SA Youth**
There is a large gap in the research about mentoring for LGBTQQIP2SA youth. Perhaps this is due to the limited mentoring programming available for LGBTQQIP2SA youth, which may be rooted in systemic discrimination and poor handling of diversity issues (Gastic & Johnson, 2009).

• **Girls**
Longer lasting relationships are important for success in mentoring girls as opposed to boys (Liang, Bogat, & Duffy, 2013). There are conflicting results about the importance of same-gender matching for program effectiveness. Some research has found potential benefits of same-gender matching, while two meta-analyses did not find evidence for increased effectiveness of same-gender matching (Darling, Bogat, Cavell, Murphy, & Sánchez, 2006).

“In good times they still check up on you, in bad times they check up on you more.” (Youth Arts Action Group Youth Consultation)
This section of the toolkit provides detailed information on best and promising practices as they relate to each of the main steps or components of a mentoring program for youth, including:

- Recruiting & Selecting Mentees
- Assessing Mentee Eligibility
- Recruiting Mentors
- Selecting & Screening Mentors
- Training Mentees
- Training Mentors
- Matching Mentees to Mentors & Initiating the Relationship
- Developing A Healthy & Safe Mentoring Relationship
- Supporting, Supervising, & Maintaining the Match
- Involving Parents / Caregivers / Families
- Closing the Match & Re-Matching
- Celebrating Efforts & Recognizing Accomplishments

Mentoring can help foster a deep connection by “just getting along with [the mentor] and understanding each other. Being able to trust them” (Covenant House Youth Consultation)

Each section contains the following information:

- **Standard**: From the *Elements of Effective Practice for Mentoring™* and other research-based guidelines, these are evidence-based best practices for creating and sustaining high-quality mentoring programs, and mentoring relationships that are safe and linked to positive outcomes for participants.

- ** Benchmarks**: From the *Elements of Effective Practice for Mentoring™* and other research-based guidelines, these practices must be followed in order to meet the Standard noted above.
• **Other Findings & Considerations:** These are other promising and innovative practices, trends, research findings, and recommendations worth noting and considering.

• **Key Tools & Resources:** Other reports, websites and online resources that contain useful, user-friendly tools, and templates for you to explore.

These generally apply to all mentoring programs, but the way you use the information will depend on the setting and/or the population served. Program staff are encouraged to be thoughtful, thorough and creative in finding effective ways to meet each standard within their context and in response to their community’s needs.

**Recruiting and Selecting Mentees**

“*You have to want to change before you can change [...] you have to want to be helped before you can accept someone’s help.*” (Youth Arts Action Group Youth Consultation)

**Standard**
Recruit appropriate mentees by realistically describing the program’s aims and expected outcomes.
(MENTOR, 2015, p. 10)

**Benchmarks**

- Use recruitment strategies that realistically portray the benefits, practices, supports, and challenges of being mentored in the program.
- Recruit mentees whose needs best match the services offered by the program.
- Establish criteria for accepting youth into the program, or disqualifying them.
- Get potential mentees to complete an application (written or verbal).
- Get parent(s)/guardian(s) to complete an application form and to provide informed permission for their child to participate (where necessary).
- Ensure mentees (and parent(s)/guardian(s) where applicable) agree in writing to the minimum time commitment that is required by the mentoring program.
- Ensure mentees (and parent(s)/guardian(s) where applicable) agree in writing that mentees participate in face-to-face meetings with their mentors at a minimum frequency and amount of hours that are required by the mentoring program.
Other Findings
A meta-analysis suggests that mentoring programs may be less effective if they serve youth who experience a high level of both individual risk factors (problem behaviours, academic struggle), and environmental risk factors (e.g., low family socioeconomic status, low parental support). This has important implications for selecting mentees that could most benefit from a mentoring relationship (Herrera, DuBois & Grossman, 2013). Youth must be motivated to participate and must be a good fit for a mentoring relationship at the time of recruitment.

Self-selection by young people is likely to produce better outcomes than young people being invited to participate or being referred by other organizations. Most importantly, the selection process should be seen as a positive opportunity, not as punishment, stigmatizing or labeling (Blaber & Glazebrook, 2006, p. 42; The Indiana Youth Institute, 2013, p. 5)

Assessing Mentees

“Personally, I would say, that my mentor should know that I’ve experienced suffering and pain in my life and it doesn’t help to look down upon that person [...] I’m a human being, I’ve experienced this, I can pick myself up.” (Covenant House Youth Consultation)

Standard
Assess each young person to determine eligibility, level of support needed, and to help with matching (i.e., interests, risks, strengths and needs).
(Herrera, DuBois & Grossman, 2013)

Benchmarks
☐ Use an intake interview as an opportunity to:
☐ Assess a young person’s attitude and interest in the program
☐ Assess the young person’s strengths, challenges and needs
☐ Gather information to help you make an appropriate match
☐ Outline the program expectations and policies/procedures

Other Findings
The initial intake and assessment phase of a mentoring program can often be the first point of meaningful contact with a young person. To build trust, this first contact should represent and be consistent with your overall philosophy of care. It is recommended that a youth-friendly dialogue format be utilized where youth can share their interests, needs, strengths, and expectations (e.g., see the B.C. Guide and Tool below, or the Strengths Assessment Inventory).
Assess the young person’s existing social network to see how the mentor can support and supplement existing positive guidance rather than compete with it, and combat negative influences. This includes identifying:

- Positive relationships the mentor can encourage and enhance;
- Existing instrumental support the mentor does not need to duplicate (i.e., skill development programs);
- Siblings that may also need a mentor; and
- Peers who are exhibiting negative behaviours (Keller & Blakeslee, 2014).

**Key Tools & Resources**

Example of a simple Intake Form:  

Assessing Risk & Youth Eligibility (Institute for Youth Success):  

The Risk Screening Tool (Herrera, DuBois, & Grossman, 2013, pp. 111-112):  
[http://www.mdrc.org/sites/default/files/Role%20of%20Risk_Final-web%20PDF.pdf](http://www.mdrc.org/sites/default/files/Role%20of%20Risk_Final-web%20PDF.pdf)

Youth Level of Service / Case Management Inventory 2.0 (YLS/CMI™ 2.0) (Hoge & Andrews):  

Search Institute Youth Surveys (Attitudes/Behaviours, Developmental Assets):  
[http://www.search-institute.org/surveys](http://www.search-institute.org/surveys)

The Child & Adolescent Needs & Strengths (CANS):  

B.C. Guide: Gender-Sensitive Needs Assessment Tool for Youth:  

Strengths Assessment Inventory (Youth version & Observer version):  
[https://www.strengthassessment.ca/](https://www.strengthassessment.ca/)
Recruiting Mentors

"[A mentor] should be a person that doesn’t see you in that mould [of being high-risk], someone who doesn't have, like, a preconceived idea of what you should be or... based on where you’re from, like they don’t have, ‘you’re supposed to be this certain way’, they’re more open to like, where you go, your ideas, your opinions, your goals.” (Youth Arts Action Group Youth Consultation)

Standard
Recruit appropriate mentors by realistically describing the program’s aims and expected outcomes. (MENTOR, 2015, p. 10)

Benchmarks
☐ Engage in recruitment strategies that realistically portray the benefits, practices, supports, and challenges of mentoring in the program.
☐ Use recruitment strategies that build positive attitudes and emotions about mentoring.
☐ Recruit mentors whose skills, motivations, and backgrounds best match the goals and structure of the program.
☐ Encourage mentors to assist with recruitment efforts by providing them with resources to ask individuals they know, who meet the eligibility criteria of the program, to be a mentor.
☐ Encourage and train mentees to identify and recruit appropriate mentors for themselves, when possible/ relevant.

(MENTOR, 2015, p. 11)

Other Findings
Create a recruitment plan to help guide and track how you will promote the program to potential volunteer mentors.

Have a publicly available written statement outlining eligibility requirements for mentors.
Use multiple strategies to recruit mentors (e.g., direct ask, social media, traditional methods of mass communication, presentations, referrals, word of mouth) on an ongoing basis. Word-of-mouth recruitment has been found to be very effective for some programs; volunteerism increases when people are asked to volunteer by someone they know (ex: friend, colleague, relative).

It is important for mentoring programs to realistically describe the requirements, rewards, and challenges of mentoring during recruitment. Provide a job description, information on time commitment & consistency, desired/required personality characteristics, characteristics of target mentees, precise schedule, and type of activities. A mentor’s unfulfilled expectations can contribute to an earlier-than-anticipated end to the mentoring relationship.

Communicate to mentors how mentoring and volunteering can benefit them (not just the mentee).

(MENTOR, 2015; Ballasy, Fullop, & Garringer, 2008)

**Key Tools & Resources**

Mentoring Fact Sheet: Volunteer Motivation and Mentor Recruitment:

Webinar: Innovative recruitment: Creative strategies for finding long-term mentors:
http://www.mentoring.org/program-resources/collaborative-mentoring-webinar-series/#1443187013681-02568e67-5ae6

Putting the ‘men’ back in mentoring: A look at one of the mentoring movement’s toughest challenges (recruiting male mentors):
http://educationnorthwest.org/sites/default/files/resources/bulletin_male_recruitment.pdf

Mentor Self-Assessment Checklist:
http://www.bbbsc.ca/members/training/course.asp?ID=volunteer&bookmark=105

Mentoring 101:
http://www.bbbsc.ca/members/training/course.asp?ID=volunteer&bookmark=101

Effective Mentor Recruitment:
http://educationnorthwest.org/sites/default/files/resources/recruitment.pdf
Men in Mentoring Toolkit:
http://www.michigan.gov/mentormichigan/0,4618,7-193-27047-211411--,00.html

Guide to Recruiting Black Men as Mentors for Black Boys:
http://www.issuelab.org/click/download2/guide_to_recruiting_black_men_as_mentors_for_black_boys

Recruiting Mentors: A Guide to Finding Volunteers to Work with Youth:
http://www.issuelab.org/click/download1/recruiting_mentors_a_guide_to_finding_volunteers

Mentor Recruitment Postcard:
http://educationnorthwest.org/sites/default/files/resources/recruitment_postcard.pdf

Marketing for the Recruitment of Mentors:
http://educationnorthwest.org/sites/default/files/resources/marketing.pdf

Top 10 Recruitment Tips:

Tips to Recruit and Retain Immigrant Volunteers:

Selecting & Screening Mentors

Youth feel that good mentors in their lives were: Open; calm; supportive; patient; honest; authentic; approachable; uplifting/encouraging; non-judgmental; demonstrated skills through tasks; motivated to support their mentee; and like a friend
(Covenant House, Youth Arts Action Group, and YWCA Youth Consultations)
**Standard**

Screen prospective mentors to determine whether they have the time, commitment, and personal qualities to be a safe and effective mentor.

(MENTOR, 2015, p. 24)

**Benchmarks**

- Establish criteria for accepting and disqualifying mentor applicants. Stick to these criteria no matter how tempting it may be to make an exception (participant safety comes first).
- Make prospective mentors complete a written application that includes questions designed to help assess their safety and suitability for mentoring a youth. This is also a key opportunity to gather information on their geographical location, availability, preferences, interests, hobbies, and skills that will help with matching.
- Conduct at least one face-to-face interview with each prospective mentor to assess the candidate’s suitability for mentoring a youth.
- Conduct a comprehensive criminal background check on prospective adult mentors, including searching a national criminal records database, along with sex offender and child abuse registries and, when relevant, driving records.
- Conduct reference check interviews with multiple adults who know an applicant (ideally, both personal and professional references) that include questions to help assess their suitability for mentoring a youth.
- Get prospective mentors to agree in writing to the minimum time commitment that is required by the mentoring program.
- Get prospective mentors to agree in writing to participate in face-to-face meetings with their mentees at a minimum frequency and amount of hours that are required by their mentoring program.

**Other Findings**

Volunteer-based youth mentoring is considered as a potentially “high-risk” context for the occurrence of abuse. While practices focused on security may feel intrusive to the applicant and time consuming to staff, they are critical in identifying potential hazards to the mentee’s safety.

You may wish to consider conducting at least one home visit of each prospective mentor, especially when the match may be meeting in the mentor’s home. If home meetings will occur, consider background checks on all adults living in the home of prospective mentors.

If you have a school-based program, assess the mentor’s interest in maintaining contact with their mentee during the summer months (following the close of the academic school year) and offer assistance to matches in maintaining contact as this typically requires more intensive supervision.

If you are recruiting adult mentors, prioritize accepting mentor applicants who are older than university- or college-age. Adult mentors who are out of school have been found to be more committed and reliable than students.

Consider using evidence-based screening tools and practices to identify individuals who have attitudes and beliefs that support safe and effective mentoring relationships.
Apart from basic eligibility criteria, additional characteristics to consider when recruiting mentors are:

- a high level of "social interest" - optimism, genuine desire to be helpful, and empathy;
- character traits - for example, approachability, enthusiasm, commitment, availability, trustworthiness, maturity, communication skills, respect, and financial stability;
- attunement - mentors should possess the quality of attunement, meaning the ability to anticipate a mentee’s needs in an empathetic manner;
- school / work performance - there is no evidence indicating high achievers make better mentors. Instead, it’s important to look for consistent attendance, positive attitude and participation in other activities;
- other commitments - consideration should be paid to a potential mentor’s schooling, extracurricular, work, or family responsibilities, which could limit their availability and thus may interfere with their ability to fully engage in the mentoring process
- special skills - although not necessary, those with special skills (e.g., the ability to speak a second language) can be beneficial to your program (Garringer & MacRae, 2008; Rhodes, et al., 2006; Satchwell, 2006; Spencer, 2007a; Vandenberghe, 2013).

Only 5% of people who express interest in mentoring will go on to become mentors (Delaney, Milne, Johansson & Merlene, 2002). Longer screening times can cause potential mentors, especially men, to lose interest in the program (Satchwell, 2006). Thus, make your selections in a timely manner (Vandenberghe, 2013, p. 14).

**Key Tools & Resources**

Generic Mentoring Program Policy & Procedure Manual:  

Screening Out Inappropriate Volunteers:  

SAFE (Screening Applicants for Effectiveness): Guidelines to Prevent Child Molestation in Mentoring and Youth-Serving Organizations:  
Training Mentees

"You shouldn't judge at all. You're meeting someone that's a stranger. Like, it doesn't matter how [the mentor] looks, how he presents himself. He's just a stranger trying to connect with and if that doesn't click, there you go, find a new one." (Covenant House Youth Consultation)

Standard
Train prospective mentees in the basic knowledge, attitudes, and skills needed to build an effective and safe mentoring relationship using culturally appropriate language and tools.
(MENTOR, 2015, p. 34)

Benchmarks
**There is less rigorous research on the impact of mentee training and no benchmarks per se were found. Refer to the evidence-informed recommendations below.

Other Findings
Most mentees are enrolled in a mentoring program by a caring adult and thus may not fully understand what it means to be mentored. By training the mentees, this will prepare them for their first meetings with their mentors; it can alleviate anxiety and help the relationships be initiated in a positive, memorable way.

Understanding the potential benefits of being mentored and setting goals for the relationship can help build motivation in mentees and empower young people to be active contributors to building their mentoring relationship.

The program should provide training tailored to mentees age, gender, ethnicity on the following topics:

a. Purpose of mentoring and how the mentor can help them
b. Program requirements (e.g., match length, match frequency, duration of visits, protocols for missing or being late to meetings, match termination)
c. Mentees’ goals for mentoring
d. Mentors’ obligations and appropriate roles (to avoid unrealistic expectations)
e. Mentees’ obligations and appropriate roles
f. Ethics and safety in mentoring relationships
g. Initiating the mentoring relationship
h. Effective closure of the mentoring relationship

The program should provide training for the mentee on the following risk management policies that are matched to the program model, setting, and population served:

a. Appropriate physical contact
b. Contact with mentoring program (e.g., who to contact, when to contact)
c. Relationship monitoring requirements (e.g., response time, frequency, schedule)
d. Approved activities
e. Mandatory reporting requirements associated with suspected child abuse or neglect, and suicidality and homicidality
f. Confidentiality and anonymity
g. Digital and social media use
h. Overnight visits and out of town travel
i. Money spent on mentee and mentoring activities
j. Transportation
k. Emergency and crisis situation procedures
l. Health and medical care
m. Discipline
n. Substance use
o. Firearms and weapons
p. Inclusion of others in match meetings (e.g., siblings, mentee’s friends)
q. Photo and image use
r. Evaluation and use of data
s. Grievance procedures
t. Other program-relevant topics

(Ballasy, Fullop, & Garringer, 2008; MENTOR, 2015, p. 36-37)

Short, interactive activities work best to keep adolescents and young adults engaged. They should be no more than 30-50 minutes long. Use the lecture format as sparingly as possible and focus on various activities and games. Trainings should be well planned, organized, and clear, as youth can quickly lose interest or become distracted (Garringer & MacRae, 2008, p. 17-18; The Indiana Youth Institute, 2013, p. 6).

**Key Tools & Resources**

Alberta Mentoring Partnership Online Mentee Training (for 12 and under):
Training Mentors

“I think [mentors] should be informed about - first consent in terms of establishing a relationship, what are their rights, as a mentee, what are the boundaries, they have the right to cut off the relationship, or stop the relationship, whenever they want to.” (Big Brothers Big Sisters of Canada Youth In Care Focus Groups)

Standard
Train prospective mentors in the basic knowledge, attitudes, and skills needed to build an effective and safe mentoring relationship using culturally appropriate language and tools.
(MENTOR, 2015, p. 34)

Benchmarks
- Provide a minimum of two hours of pre-match, in-person mentor training.
- Supplement with post-match training as much as possible.
Pre-match training for mentors should cover the following topics:

- Program requirements (e.g., match length, match frequency, duration of visits, protocols for missing, being late to meetings, and match termination)
- Mentors’ goals and expectations for the mentee, parent or guardian, and the mentoring relationship
- Mentors’ obligations and appropriate roles
- Relationship development and maintenance
- Ethical and safety issues that may arise related to the mentoring relationship
- Effective closure of the mentoring relationship
- Sources of assistance available to support mentors
- Opportunities and challenges associated with mentoring specific populations of youth (e.g., youth involved in the criminal justice system, youth in foster care, youth with mental health needs)
- Initiating the mentoring relationship
- Developing an effective, positive relationship with mentee’s family, if relevant

Provide pre-match training for the mentor on the following risk management policies that are matched to the program model, setting, and population served:

- Appropriate physical contact
- Contact with mentoring program (e.g., who to contact, when to contact)
- Relationship monitoring requirements (e.g., response time, frequency, schedule)
- Approved activities
- Mandatory reporting requirements associated with suspected child abuse or neglect, and suicidality and homicidality
- Confidentiality and anonymity
- Digital and social media use
- Overnight visits and out of town travel
- Money spent on mentee and mentoring activities
- Transportation
- Emergency and crisis situation procedures
- Health and medical care
- Discipline
- Substance use
- Firearms and weapons
- Inclusion of others in match meetings (e.g., siblings, mentee’s friends)
- Photo and image use
- Evaluation and use of data
• Grievance procedures
• Other program relevant topics

☐ Use training practices and materials that are informed by empirical research or are themselves empirically evaluated.

☐ Mentors should be trained in being sensitive to power differentials that are inherent in adult-youth relationships, and the skills needed for collaborative decision-making, positive communication, and resolving conflict with mentees (i.e., having conflicting goals, interests, and preferences).

☐ Mentors should be taught what being trustworthy, responsible, and acting with integrity means in the context of a mentoring relationship. Mentors need to promote justice and not engage in discrimination towards their mentees. Finally, mentors need to respect the rights and dignity of their mentees and their mentees’ families.

☐ For mentoring programs where mentors will interact with the mentee’s family, the Standard (MENTOR, 2015) now requires that mentors receive training in how to develop an effective, positive relationship with their mentee’s parents or guardians. Mentoring programs need to be explicit in training mentors about the nature of the relationship that is expected between mentors and family members, so that expectations are clear to everyone involved in the match and mentors have a clear sense of how to behave with the main parent/guardian/important person in the youth’s life.

**Other Findings**

Mentoring programs need to clearly address the relationship orientation of their program - instrumental and/or developmental (p. Error! Bookmark not defined.) - in both pre- and post-match mentor training.

Long-term positive mentoring relationships develop through demonstrating positive relationship behaviours such as authenticity, empathy, collaboration, and companionship (Spencer, 2006).

Training should focus on developing and sustaining these relationship-enhancing behaviours, including how to foster a developmental (i.e., cooperative, mentee-driven relationship designed to meet the needs of the mentee) versus prescriptive (i.e., mentor as authority figure) relationship.

**Pre-match training**

To increase match duration and the potential for positive youth outcomes, provide additional pre-match training opportunities beyond the two-hour, in-person minimum, for a total of six hours or more. Less than two hours of pre-match training has resulted in mentors who reported the lowest levels of closeness with their mentees, spent less time with their mentees, and were less likely to continue their relationships with their mentees in a second year compared to mentors who received at least six hours of training.

**Post-match training**

Provide ongoing, post-match training on these topics:

• How developmental functioning may affect the mentoring relationship.
• How culture, gender, race, religion, socioeconomic status, and other demographic characteristics of the mentor and mentee may affect the mentoring relationship (cultural competency training). Ethnocultural empathy, or empathy towards people in racial and ethnic groups that are different from one’s own, may contribute to more positive outcomes in cross-cultural mentoring matches. This is particularly important for mentors who will find themselves in matches with youth of a different background and/or life experiences than their own (Vandenberghe, 2013).
• Topics tailored to the needs and characteristics of the mentee.
• Closure procedures.

Use post-match training to continue to screen mentors for suitability to be a mentor and to develop techniques for early trouble-shooting if problems arise. Post-match training can play a central role in helping mentors understand setbacks, and maintain or restore momentum in the relationship.

Even if the topic of closure was addressed early on, it must be re-addressed post-match about closure procedures and approaches that increase the likelihood of a successful transition out of the mentoring relationship.

**Training mediums and approaches**
Online training is an effective way of providing high quality, engaging, standardized, and easily accessible education to anyone involved in a mentoring relationship, especially when it incorporates multimedia and interactive learning methods. Compared to mentors who received only in-person training, mentors who received both online training and in-person training had greater knowledge about mentoring, were more aware of the roles mentors should and should not play, had less false expectations, and felt more efficacious, more ready, and better prepared to mentor. Developing or enhancing behavioural skills can best be practiced and role-played during in-person training. In-person training should give learners ample opportunity to practice and apply the skills that they have learned to examples that may occur in mentoring situations. Use visual, auditory, writing, and hands-on methods to reach a variety of different types of learners.

**Key Tools & Resources**
Alberta Mentoring Partnership – In-Person Training Framework:

Mentor Training Event Toolkit:
http://www.albertamentors.ca/training/mentor-training-event-toolkit/

Alberta Mentoring Partnership – Online Mentor Training:
http://albertamentors.ca/be-a-mentor/online-mentor-training/

Talking It Through: Communication Skills for Mentors:
Training New Mentors:
http://educationnorthwest.org/sites/default/files/resources/training.pdf

Preparing Participants for Mentoring:
http://educationnorthwest.org/sites/default/files/resources/training_initial.pdf

Ongoing Training for Mentors – Twelve Interactive Sessions:
http://educationnorthwest.org/sites/default/files/resources/training_initial.pdf

Mentoring Fact Sheet: Avoiding Early Match Termination:

Mentor Resources – Decision Making. Online Training Module:

Mentor Resources – Talking About Smoking. Online Training Module:

Mentor Resources – Resilience. Online Training Module:

Mentor Resources – Motivation, Expectation & Approach. Online Training Module:

Mentor Resources – Bullying. Online Training Module:

Mentoring Central Online Mentor Training Modules:
http://www.mentoringcentral.net/train-mentors/

Fact Sheets on Mentoring and Youth Development:
Ongoing Training for Mentors:

Peer Mentor Handbook:
http://www.mentoringpittsburgh.org/media/W1siZiIsIjIwMTQvMDUvMDcvMTRfNTRfNDfOTM4X1BiZXJfTWVudG9yaW5nX0hhbmRib29rLnBkZiJdXQ/Peer Mentoring Handbook.pdf?sha=aa29c204

Preparing for Your Mentoring Relationship:
https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=lo80WeS82C4

Tools for Mentoring Adolescents:
http://www.mpmn.org/ToolsforMentoringAdolescents.aspx

Social Networking Tips for Mentors:

Deep Mentor Training Guide:
http://www.issuelab.org/click/download1/deep_mentoring_training_guide

Training New Mentors:
http://www.issuelab.org/click/download2/training_new_mentors

See Mentoring 101: An Introductory Workshop for New Mentors for a comprehensive manual about training mentors working with youth with disabilities (Callahan, Endelman, Manning, & Thomas, 2013)

Refer to Mentoring Immigrant and Refugee Youth for examples of training activities for mentors in newcomer youth mentoring programs (MENTOR, 2007, pp. 56-58)

Going the Distance:
http://educationnorthwest.org/sites/default/files/resources/going_the_distance.pdf
Matching & Initiating the Relationship

“I feel like it doesn’t matter if they have similarities or not with you too much as long as you connect with them.” (Covenant House Youth Consultation)

**Standard**
Match mentors and mentees, and initiate the mentoring relationship using strategies likely to increase the odds that mentoring relationships will endure and be effective. (MENTOR, 2015, p. 54)

**Benchmarks**
- Consider the characteristics of the mentor and mentee (e.g., interests; proximity; availability; age; gender; race; ethnicity; personality; expressed preferences of mentor, mentee, and parent or guardian; goals; strengths; previous experiences) when making matches.
- Arrange and document an initial meeting between the mentor and mentee as well as, when relevant, with the parent or guardian. A program staff member should be on site and/or present during these meetings.
- Bring all concerned parties together in person to sign a commitment agreement consenting to the program’s rules and requirements (e.g., frequency, intensity and duration of match meetings; roles of each person involved in the mentoring relationship; frequency of contact with program), and risk management policies. It is particularly important for everyone involved in the mentoring relationship to have clear expectations from the beginning.

(Don’t try to get personal too quick [...] Cause like we can talk about one thing and if it jumps to something else and it goes that route that’s whatever. But, let me be the one leading it there.” (Covenant House Youth Consultation)
Other Findings
Matching mentors and mentees based on similarities such as age, gender, race, and ethnicity, and mutual interests is frequently recommended. However, research comparing cross-race and same-race matches has found few, if any, differences in the development of relationship quality or in positive outcomes, suggesting that matching on race may not be a critical dimension of a successful mentoring relationship, in general. Similarly, there is currently no strong evidence that gender impacts match satisfaction. Some evidence shows that female-identified mentors are more receptive to long-term mentoring relationships and value intimacy and connection, whereas male-identified mentors seem to prefer more activity-based mentoring where the active part of the relationship can develop more quickly. The Mentoring Centre (2000) suggests that for youth deemed high-risk and very high-risk, matching according to ethnic and gender identity should be strongly considered.

Although the research is not yet conclusive, matching based on common interests should take precedence over matching based on race and/or gender alone. **Most importantly, programs should take into consideration the individual personal interests, needs and preferences of the participants and their families** (DuBois & Karcher, 2014, p. 168; Liang, Bogat & Duffy, 2014).

That said, be cognizant and attentive to **difficulties** that may arise in mentoring across race and gender. Research shows that cross-race and cross-gender relationships can have difficulty forming, developing, and maturing. Negative stereotypes, difficulty with identification and role modeling, skepticism about intimacy, public scrutiny, peer teasing or resentment, and “protective hesitation” (fear of misunderstandings, confrontations, and disagreements) can impact the match in unfavourable ways (Thomas, 2001).

Research has shown some promising preliminary support for allowing mentees to choose their mentor. To assist in the process of matching mentors and mentees, some mentoring programs host a group event where prospective mentors and mentees can meet and interact with one another in an organized fashion, and then provide feedback to the mentoring program regarding their preferences for matching. Hosting a “Meet-n-Greet” consisting of a series of activities can help demonstrate preferences and connections. Ensure that participants only see it as a fun gathering to get to know each other to avoid feelings of pressure or disappointment. After the Meet-n-Greet, ask the mentees and mentors to name 2-3 people they felt they connected with and try to make matches accordingly. If you can’t match a mentee with a mentor they’ve named, consider matching them with a mentor that named them – helping them feel ‘chosen’ and promoting positive self-perception beliefs (Big Brothers Big Sisters of Canada, 2009). Giving mentees and mentors some “voice and choice” in matching is based on the idea that this practice will be associated with greater engagement in the program.

In the case of cross-age peer matching, mentees should be matched with a mentor who is at least three years older than the mentee.

Consider providing an opportunity for the parent(s) or guardian(s) to provide feedback about the mentor selected by the program, prior to the initiation meeting.

If the mentor will be picking up the mentee at the mentee’s home for match meetings, an initial match meeting should occur at the home of the mentee with the program staff member present.
Prepare the mentor, mentee and family member for the initial meeting after the match determination has been made (e.g., provide background information about prospective mentee/mentor; remind participants of confidentiality; discuss potential opportunities and challenges associated with mentoring).

Consider using a trial period for a match, and/or monitor the relationship regularly to determine whether the match is as good as originally hoped (DuBois & Karcher, 2014, p. 434; Pryce et al., 2014).

Finally, mentors with prior experience should be oriented towards youth with higher needs or more troubled circumstances (Big Brothers Big Sisters of Canada, 2009).

Key Tools & Resources

Alberta Mentoring Partnership – In-Person Training Framework:  

Mentor Training Event Toolkit:  
http://www.albertamentors.ca/training/mentor-training-event-toolkit/

Alberta Mentoring Partnership – Online Mentor Training:  
http://albertamentors.ca/be-a-mentor/online-mentor-training/

Talking It Through: Communication Skills for Mentors:  
http://talkingitthrough.educationnorthwest.org/

Training New Mentors:  
http://educationnorthwest.org/sites/default/files/resources/training.pdf

Preparing Participants for Mentoring:  
http://educationnorthwest.org/sites/default/files/resources/training_initial.pdf

Ongoing Training for Mentors – Twelve Interactive Sessions:  
http://educationnorthwest.org/sites/default/files/resources/training_initial.pdf
Mentoring Fact Sheet: Avoiding Early Match Termination:

Mentor Resources – Decision Making. Online Training Module:

Mentor Resources – Talking About Smoking. Online Training Module:

Mentor Resources – Resilience. Online Training Module:

Mentor Resources – Motivation, Expectation & Approach. Online Training Module:

Mentor Resources – Bullying. Online Training Module:

Mentoring Central Online Mentor Training Modules:
http://www.mentoringcentral.net/train-mentors/

Fact Sheets on Mentoring and Youth Development:
http://educationnorthwest.org/sites/default/files/resources/factsheet15.pdf

Ongoing Training for Mentors:

Peer Mentor Handbook:
http://www.mentoringpittsburgh.org/media/W1siZiIsIiwvMTQvMDUvMDcvMTRfNTRfNDVfOTM4X1BiZXJfTWVudG9yaW5nX0hhbmRib29rLnBkZiJdXQ/PeerMentoringHandbook.pdf?sha=aa29c204

Preparing for Your Mentoring Relationship:
Tools for Mentoring Adolescents:
http://www.mpmn.org/ToolsforMentoringAdolescents.aspx

Social Networking Tips for Mentors:

Deep Mentor Training Guide:
http://www.issuelab.org/click/download1/deep_mentoring_training_guide

Training New Mentors:
http://www.issuelab.org/click/download2/training_new_mentors

See Mentoring 101: An Introductory Workshop for New Mentors for a comprehensive manual about training mentors working with youth with disabilities (Callahan, Endelman, Manning, & Thomas, 2013)

Refer to Mentoring Immigrant and Refugee Youth for examples of training activities for mentors in newcomer youth mentoring programs (MENTOR, 2007, pp. 56-58)

Going the Distance:
http://educationnorthwest.org/sites/default/files/resources/going_the_distance.pdf

Developing a Healthy & Safe Mentoring Relationship

“If someone shows you that they could be vulnerable to you and when you see their vulnerability it kinda makes you open up a bit.” (YWCA Youth Consultation)

Standard
Adopt and communicate program policies and procedures that are relevant to developing a healthy mentoring relationship and to protecting the safety and well-being of the mentee, mentor, and family. Foster a healthy balance in terms of the involvement of the mentor and mentee in decision-making around processes, goals and activities. (Garringer & MacRae, 2008; MENTOR, 2015 p. 35-38, 78)
Benchmarks
- Develop policies and procedures that are clearly communicated to mentees, mentors and families. These policies and procedures should be based upon an assessment of the possible situations that may arise in the context of the mentoring relationship and should be regularly reviewed and updated.
- Involve both mentees and mentors in discussions and decision-making around program processes, goals and activities. When mentors are dominant in decisions and activities, mentees may become disengaged and experience a loss of ownership. Conversely, if mentees are allowed to take sole control of decisions and activities, they can often come to a halt or lose focus.

"One thing [mentors] need to know is like, when, what's the difference when somebody's looking for advice or just venting. Because sometimes you just trying to get stuff out, but you're not trying to get any help. You just need someone to listen to that and other times, it's like, 'I'm telling you this because I want somebody to help me out'. So, sometimes it's just good to know what the difference is." (Covenant House Youth Consultation)

Other Findings
There are many program policies that are relevant to developing a healthy mentoring relationship and to protecting the safety and health of the mentee, mentor, and the mentee’s family. These include:
- Child Protection policy
- Transportation policy
- Social Media Policy: clear boundaries and accepted/unaccepted uses of social media and other such technologies. Staff should be aware of and potentially involved in the use of social media between participants (i.e., program facilitated communication with staff present) (Kremer, 2013).

Whether your program adopts an instrumental or developmental approach to the mentoring relationship, or a combination of the two (see p. Error! Bookmark not defined.), make sure matches have the time and freedom to form relationships by engaging each other in ways that are fun, creative, and unique to each participant. Structured activities are good, but too many can inhibit the development of the relationship in a more organic fashion (MENTOR, 2015).

Karcher & Hansen (2014) found that when mentors advocate for the youth by acting on the youth’s behalf outside of the match (i.e. helping them seek out/resolve educational opportunities, recreation, etc.), the youth may improve more than when such efforts of advocacy do not occur.

Key Tools & Resources
Generic Mentoring Program Policy & Procedure Manual:
Building Relationships: A Guide for New Mentors:
http://educationnorthwest.org/sites/default/files/resources/training.pdf

Webinar: Cultural and class conflicts in mentor-mentee matches (2015):
http://www.mentoring.org/program-resources/collaborative-mentoring-webinar-series/#1447339499762-96a34fe3-8efb

Little Big Activity App. Big Brother Big Sisters Mobile App:

Mentoring Activity Ideas:

Range of Issues & Communication in Crises:

Building Attachment:

Boundaries:

Webinar: Strategies for mentoring youth affected by trauma:
http://www.mentoring.org/program-resources/collaborative-mentoring-webinar-series/#1443188263317-8c2ed6fa-e1fc

Discovering the Possibilities: “C”ing Your Future. Guide of Activities for Post-Secondary / Career-Focused Mentoring:

What’s Next? Introduction to Post-Secondary Education Planning:
http://youthbuildmentoringalliance.org/whats-next-pse

Mentoring Fact Sheet: Overcoming Relationship Pitfalls:
Mentoring Fact Sheet: Avoiding Early Match Termination:

Fact Sheet: Helping a Grieving Mentee:

Refer to Making the Grade for ideas of how to build a relationship with a mentee and activities for academic-focused mentoring (Cannata, Garringer, MacRae, & Wakeland, 2005)

Refer to Girls Group Mentoring Toolkit to find information about approaches and activities for mentoring programs for girls with special considerations (e.g., girls in rural and remote communities) (Canadian Women’s Foundation, 2015, pp. 29-52)

Supporting, Supervising & Maintaining the Match

“Confidentiality is key, make it as informal as possible” (Covenant House Youth Consultation)

Standard
Monitor mentoring relationship milestones and youth safety. Support matches by providing ongoing advice, problem solving, training, and access to resources for the duration of each relationship. (MENTOR, 2015, p. 60)

Benchmarks
☐ Contact mentees and mentors at least twice per month for the first month of the match and once a month thereafter. Contacts may need to occur more frequently should challenges arise.
☐ At each monitoring contact, program staff should ask about mentoring activities, mentee outcomes, child safety issues, the quality of the mentoring relationship, and the impact of mentoring on the mentor and mentee using a standardized procedure.
☐ Monitoring of the relationship should especially focus on the development of a strong bond between mentor and mentee, as youth who perceive more trusting, mutual, and empathic relations with their mentors experience greater improvements than youth who perceive lower levels of these relationship qualities. Group mentoring programs must consider gathering additional information during the monitoring contacts such as any concerns about the group dynamics or challenges common to the group.
☐ Contact an important and responsible adult in each mentee’s life (e.g., parent, guardian or important person in the mentee’s life) at least twice per month for the first month of the match and once a month thereafter. Ask about mentoring activities, mentee outcomes, child safety issues, the quality of the mentoring relationship, and the impact of mentoring on the mentee using a standardized procedure.
☐ Document information about each mentor-mentee meeting including at a minimum, the date, length, and description of activity completed.
Regularly assess all matches to determine if they should be closed or encouraged to continue.

Provide mentors with access to relevant resources (e.g., expert advice from program staff or others, publications, Web-based resources, experienced mentors) to help them address challenges in their mentoring relationships as they arise.

Provide mentees and parents or guardians with access or referrals to relevant resources (e.g., expert advice from program staff or others, publications, Web-based resources, available social service referrals) to help families address needs and challenges as they arise.

Provide one or more opportunities per year for post-match mentor training.

Provide mentors with feedback on a regular basis regarding their mentees’ outcomes and the impact of mentoring on their mentee, to continuously improve mentee outcomes and encourage mentor retention.

(MENTOR, 2015, p. 60-62)

“They have to be trustworthy, because if you don’t trust them you’re obviously not going to feel 100% safe with them.” (Youth Arts Action Group Youth Consultation)

Other Findings
Mentoring relationships that end prematurely may lead to particularly negative consequences for mentees, including declines of self-worth or self-confidence. It is most often mentors who initiate the end of a match. One of the leading reasons for premature termination of matches by mentors is unmet expectations. Creating a space to manage mentor expectations is key to mentor retention (Evans, 2005; Spencer, 2007b; U.S. Department of Education Mentoring Resource Center, 2007). Specific reasons provided for the end of the match by mentors are:

- that they felt their mentees were not interested enough (Herrera et al., 2013; Vandenbergh, 2013);
- they had the impression that their mentees did not seem to need or benefit from a mentor (Herrera et al., 2013; Vandenbergh, 2013);
- the program’s lack of youth focus (i.e. too much structure or red tape); (U.S. Department of Education Mentoring Resource Center, 2007)
- an inability to bridge cultural differences (U.S. Department of Education Mentoring Resource Center, 2007); and
- family interference in the match (U.S. Department of Education Mentoring Resource Center, 2007).

Providing mentors with feedback about their mentee and the mentoring relationship gives program staff the opportunity to ensure that mentors have realistic and positive expectations reducing the likelihood of premature match termination. Feedback to mentors could also impact their feelings of self-efficacy as a mentor. When mentors experience greater self-efficacy about the mentoring relationship they are more satisfied, meet more frequently with their mentees, report fewer challenges in their mentoring relationships, perceive more benefits for mentees, and have higher quality mentoring relationships.

Making sure that mentors are prepared to deal with distressing situations and have strategies for coping with challenging and upsetting situations may help improve mentor satisfaction and retention, and keep everyone safe.
Host one or more group activities for matches and/or offer information about activities that matches might wish to participate in together. Garnering community support (i.e. free tickets to activities) allows matches to explore new avenues of interest and learning, and feel included in the community (Ballasy, Fullop, & Garringer, 2008).

Host one or more group activities for matches and mentees’ families.

Thank mentors for their contributions and thank the family of the mentee for supporting the mentee’s engagement in mentoring prior to match closure (see p. Error! Bookmark not defined.).

Staff turnover can negatively affect the sustainability of matches, so ensure staff consistency where possible (Keller, 2007; Indiana Youth Institute, 2013, p. 7; Vandenberghe, 2013, p. 23, Bania, 2014).

(MENTOR, 2015, p. 62-66)

Key Tools & Resources

Types of Supervision:  

Mentoring Fact Sheet: Managing Risk After the Match is Made:  

Mentoring Fact Sheet: Avoiding Early Match Termination:  

Fact Sheet: Comprehensive Approaches to Mentor Retention:  
http://educationnorthwest.org/sites/default/files/resources/factsheet27.pdf

Match Monitoring: Questions to Guide Mentoring Professionals:  

Supporting Mentors:  
http://www.issuelab.org/click/download1/supporting_mentors
Creating and Sustaining a Winning Match:
http://www.emt.org/userfiles/MatchSeries2.pdf

Going the Distance:
http://educationnorthwest.org/sites/default/files/resources/going_the_distance.pdf

Keeping Matches in Touch Over the Summer Months:
http://educationnorthwest.org/sites/default/files/resources/Keeping_Matches_in_Touch.pdf

Overcoming Relationship Pitfalls:

Mentor’s Monthly Report:

Online Mentoring Activity Log:

Quality Relationship Rubric: Best Practice Resource – Match Support:

Sample Ongoing Monitoring Questions:

Sample Child Safety Checklist:

Supervision Guidelines & Questions:
Involving Parents, Caregivers or Family

**Standard**
When appropriate, train parents (or legal guardians or an important adult in the youth’s life) in the basic knowledge, attitudes, and skills needed to support an effective and safe mentoring relationship.
(MENTOR, 2015)

**Benchmarks**
- Establish a congenial and collaborative working relationship with the mentee’s parents or guardians, or other significant adult in their lives.
(MENTOR, 2015, p. 43)

**Other Findings**
Mentoring relationships are more likely to succeed if programs reach out to parents/guardians as the match progresses, soliciting their feedback and addressing their concerns. Getting ‘buy-in’ from parents can provide mentoring relationships with the stability and support they need to flourish (DuBois et al., 2002; U.S. Department of Education Mentoring Resource Center, 2007).

Be explicit with mentors about the nature of the relationship that is expected between mentors and family members, so that expectations are clear to everyone.

Using culturally appropriate language and tools, provide training for the parent(s) or guardian(s) (when appropriate) on the following topics:

1. Purpose of mentoring
2. Program requirements (e.g., match length, match frequency, duration of visits, protocols for missing or being late to meetings, match termination)
3. Parents’ and mentees’ goals for mentoring
4. Mentors’ obligations and appropriate roles
5. Mentees’ obligations and appropriate roles
6. Ethics and safety in mentoring relationships
7. Initiating the mentoring relationship
8. Developing an effective, working relationship with your child’s mentor
9. Effective closure of the mentoring relationship

Provide training for the parent(s) or guardian(s) on the following risk management policies that are matched to the program model, setting, and population served:

1. Appropriate physical contact
2. Contact with mentoring program (e.g., who to contact, when to contact)
3. Relationship monitoring requirements (e.g., response time, frequency, schedule)
4. Approved activities
5. Mandatory reporting requirements associated with suspected child abuse or neglect, and suicidality and homicidality
6. Confidentiality and anonymity
7. Digital and social media use
8. Overnight visits and out of town travel
9. Money spent on mentee and mentoring activities
10. Transportation
11. Emergency and crisis situation procedures
12. Health and medical care
13. Discipline
14. Substance use
15. Firearms and weapons
16. Inclusion of others in match meetings (e.g., siblings, mentee’s friends)
17. Photo and image use
18. Evaluation and use of data
19. Grievance procedures
20. Other program relevant topics

Parents are more likely to engage when they develop an interest in playing an influential role, have a sense of efficacy for helping their children, and see positive opportunities and invitations to get involved.

Programs should reach out to parents/guardians by:
- Conducting orientation sessions
- Following up after orientation sessions and providing print materials
- Providing a program handbook
- Giving parents a prominent role in finalizing the match
- Checking in frequently
- Communicating in a variety of ways (i.e. newsletter, phone call, email)
- Providing access to other support services in the community (i.e. recreation, adult education, support groups)
- Hosting group outings and family events
- Providing recognition to parents
- Enlisting parents as volunteers (in marketing, recruitment, evaluation or resource development) (The Indiana Youth Institute, 2013, p. 8)
Practical suggestions on how to involve parents or guardians:

- Meet with parents in person
- Host an open house
- Invite parents to take part in or observe the program
- Organize family nights and provide food and childcare for other siblings; invite other important community members to these events (Alberta Mentoring Partnership, 2013; DuBois & Karcher, 2014, p. 457; Vandenberghe, 2013, p. 22-23).

Make parental involvement an explicit part of your program planning, ensuring someone is responsible for this aspect of the program and funds are available to support these activities (DuBois & Karcher, 2014, p. 457; Vandenberghe, 2013, p. 22-23).

Note of caution: some research suggests that it is preferable not to engage parents in the mentoring process too much to minimize the risk of them intentionally or unintentionally disrupting the mentor-mentee relationship through the blurring of boundaries or other potential parent-child tensions (DuBois & Karcher, 2014, p. 457; Taylor, 2014; Vandenberghe, 2013, p. 22-23).

Key Tools & Resources

Mentoring Fact Sheet: Involving Parents in Mentoring Programs:

Guide to Mentoring for Parents and Guardians:
http://educationnorthwest.org/sites/default/files/resources/parent_handbook-1.doc

Supporting YouthBuild Students in Mentoring Relationships. Customizable Mentoring Handbook for Parents/ Guardians/ Caregivers:
http://youthbuildmentoringalliance.org/webfm_send/363

Involving Parents in Mentoring Programs:

Parent Check-In Questions:

Refer to Making the Grade for a sample Parent/Guardian contract
(Cannata, Garringer, MacRae, & Wakeland, 2005, A-4)
**Closing the Match & Re-Matching**

**Standard**
Facilitate bringing the match to closure in a way that affirms the contributions of the mentor and mentee, and offers them the opportunity to prepare for the closure and assess the experience.
(MENTOR, 2015, p. 70)

**Benchmarks**
- Develop a procedure to manage anticipated and unanticipated closures, when members of the match are willing and able to engage in the closure process.
- Develop a procedure to manage closure when one member of the match is unable or unwilling to engage in the closure process.
- Conduct exit interview with mentors and mentees, and when relevant, with parents or guardians.
- Develop a written policy and procedure, when relevant, for managing rematching (if, when, how).
- Develop a written public statement to parents/guardians, mentors, and mentees that outlines the terms of match closure and the policies for mentor/mentee contact after a match ends (e.g., including contacts using digital or social media).
- Document that closure procedures were followed.
- Regardless of the reason for closure, facilitate a discussion with mentees, parents/guardians, and mentors that includes the following topics of conversation:
  1. Discussion of feelings about closure
  2. Discussion of reasons for closure, if relevant
  3. Discussion of positive experiences in the mentoring relationship
  4. Procedure for notifying the mentor or the mentee and his or her parents, if relevant, far enough in advance of the anticipated closure meeting to provide sufficient time to adequately prepare for closure
  5. Review of program rules for post-closure contact
  6. Creation of a plan for post-closure contact, if relevant
  7. Creation of a plan for the last match meeting, if possible
  8. Discussion of possible rematching, if relevant

(Ballasy, Fullop, & Garringer, 2008, p. 128; Lakes & Karcher, 2013; MENTOR, 2015, p. 71)

**Other Findings**
Less than half (<50%) of relationships established through formal mentoring programs last for their initial intended time commitment (DuBois & Karcher, 2014, p. 469; Spencer & Basualdo-Delmonico, 2014).
Closure is one of the most important considerations in the mentoring process and if not done well there could be negative emotional consequences for the mentee.

There is also some evidence that there may be some negative outcomes for mentees who experience a premature match closure and who are then remarried to a new mentor. This research is lacking and not entirely conclusive. Nonetheless, agencies should have specific, written policies for remarriage that take into consideration the desires of the mentee, and the potential consequences of remarriage.

Program staff should provide pre- and post-match training to prepare mentors and mentees for match closure and how to end the relationship in a positive way. Preparing for it must start early (Ballasy, Fullop, & Garringer, 2008, p. 128; Lakes & Karcher, 2013).

At the conclusion of the mentoring relationship, explore the opportunity with mentors, mentees, and (when relevant) parents or guardians to continue the match for an additional period of time.

Host a final celebration meeting or event for mentors and mentees, when relevant, to mark progress and transition or acknowledge change in the mentoring.

Provide training and support to mentees as well as, when relevant, to parents or guardians, about how mentees can identify and connect with natural mentors in their lives.

Relationships with natural mentors have been associated with positive outcomes for youth outside of a formal mentoring relationship. Upon exiting a formal mentoring relationship, agency staff may help guide mentees to identifying contexts and methods in which to identify potential adults who may be a positive natural mentor for them.

One best practice recommendation for closure activities is to hold a graduation night for all members of the mentoring relationship in order to end the relationship with a positive celebration that formally marks the transition in the relationship.

(MENTOR, 2015, p. 72)

Key Tools & Resources

Guidelines for Effective Termination of the Match:
Webinar: “They always come and they never say goodbye”: Understanding healthy closure in youth mentoring (2015):

Mentee/Mentor Termination Ritual:
www.mentoring.org/downloads/mentoring_605.doc

Match Closure:

Closure Policy/Procedure:

Relationship Closure – Continued Contact Agreement:

Functional vs. Dysfunctional Relationship Endings:

Mentee Closure and Termination Agreement:

Mentor Closure and Termination Agreement:

Parent/Guardian Closure & Termination Agreement:

Friendship Review (Sample Exit Interview):
Celebrating Efforts & Successes

Standard
Recognize the efforts and accomplishments of mentees, mentors, family members and staff to celebrate successes and promote continued positive engagement.
(Ballasy, Fullop, & Garringer, 2008 p. 122-123)

Benchmarks

- Recognize mentors on an annual basis (at minimum) to increase mentors’ perceptions of self-efficacy and encourage mentors to continue volunteering.
- Recognize families who are participating in the mentoring relationship by thanking them on an annual basis (at minimum) for their contributions to the mentoring program.

(MENTOR, 2015)

Other Findings
Recognizing your participants’ contributions and efforts significantly increases their satisfaction and match longevity (MENTOR, 2015).

Personalize recognition gestures as much as possible to each participant and his/her specific qualities, likes and efforts (Ballasy, Fullop, & Garringer, 2008, p. 122-123).

Apart from an annual ceremony, create multiple ways to recognize your participants throughout the year, i.e. useful incentives, participant “business cards”, sending birthday and holiday cards, letters of appreciation, newsletters, hosting a variety of participant recognition events, distributing certificates, etc. (Ballasy, Fullop, & Garringer, 2008, p. 122-123). Volunteers report that informal, personal forms of recognition such as thank you notes are the most meaningful.

Hold a graduation night for all members of the mentoring relationship in order to end the relationship with a positive celebration that formally marks the transition in the relationship (U.S. Department of Education, 2009).

Key Tools & Resources

Generic Mentoring Program Policy & Procedure Manual:

Fact Sheet: Comprehensive Approaches to Mentor Retention:
http://educationnorthwest.org/sites/default/files/resources/factsheet27.pdf
MENTORING FOR YOUTH WITH SPECIFIC NEEDS

The youth consultation participants for this project noted that there are certain times where they could have really benefitted from having a mentor:

- When my mother kicked me out at the age of 17 years old
- When I was not doing so well in basketball
- When I started to realize that not everybody I trusted was trustworthy
- When I moved to a different school
- When I got caught up with the law
- When I lost someone really close to me
- During my teen years when I was surrounded by bad influences
- The first time I was in a shelter and had to leave home

(Covenant House, Youth Arts Action Group, and YWCA Youth Consultations)

Mentoring for youth should begin with the best practices mentioned in the previous section. It is equally important that the mentoring program is specifically designed for the individual and complex needs of each youth (MENTOR, 2015).

The following sections gather existing knowledge on mentoring youth with specific characteristics and life experiences. Many youth facing multiple barriers to success embody a wide range of strengths and assets and young people may present with one or more of these specific considerations. Thus, the separation of the materials may be somewhat superficial, but it allows us to present the evidence in an organized way. It is important to consider the range and intersections of specific findings that may apply to the youth and the community you serve.

“The times in my life when I felt like I can use a mentor was when I was young and still growing into the man I am today. I knew I was different, but didn’t know I was good different. Quiet because I think about deep things that most people my age don’t think about. I had a different intellect, but didn’t have confidence in myself. Didn’t believe in myself because people reject what they don’t understand and I believed them. Today I know my worth and I would make a perfect mentor for my past self.” (Youth Arts Action Group Youth Consultation)

Due to the unique experiences, needs, and challenges of youth facing barriers to success, one recurring suggestion is to ensure cultural appropriateness of the programming. Mentoring interventions can emphasize cultural appropriateness by tailoring activities to the specific youth population.
“Sensitivity to other cultures refers to the awareness of how other ethnic, racial, and/or linguistic groups differ from one’s own. Sensitivity can be manifested through knowledge of different languages or manners of speech, norms, and mores, religious beliefs and practices, family structures and dynamics, community decision-making patterns, and class consciousness and socioeconomic realities.” (Elder, 2002)

Given the scope of this review and the research available we were not able to cover every possible special population of youth (e.g., gang-involved youth and youth living in rural communities).

Explore the following populations for more information about understanding and supporting youth with particular needs through mentoring:

- Youth with Academic Challenges
- Indigenous Youth
- Racialized Youth
- Newcomer Youth
- Youth with Developmental and Other Disabilities
- Youth with Mental Health Needs
- LGBTTQQIP2SA Youth
- Youth In or Leaving Care
- Youth Involved with the Criminal Justice System
- Homeless Youth
- Girls

Youth with Academic Challenges

Key Lessons

- Mentoring for youth with academic challenges should focus on relational support and engaging in fun activities to build rapport as opposed to teaching or tutoring alone.
- Mentors should support mentees in having a voice and making decisions in the relationship.
- Mentoring interventions may be more effective if they partner with schools to support the youth.

Existing Toolkits & Resources

Making the grade: A guide to incorporating academic achievement into mentoring programs and relationships: http://educationnorthwest.org/sites/default/files/making-the-grade.pdf
## Effective Mentoring for Youth with Academic Challenges

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Standards &amp; Good Practices (linked to positive outcomes for participants)</th>
<th>Other Pertinent Info (from other studies &amp; reports)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Program Planning</td>
<td><strong>Partnering with schools</strong> is important for mentoring programs targeted to youth with academic challenge to create systems of support for the youth in the program.⁷</td>
<td>Youth who struggle with academics may be less likely to have the supports in place to develop informal mentoring relationships that can support their overall growth.¹</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Program Implementation</td>
<td>Programs are more effective for youth who experience academic challenges when:</td>
<td>Mentoring programs tend to have more positive effects on social, as opposed to academic development.⁸</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Mentors and mentees have more time to spend together</td>
<td>Typically, the higher the needs of the mentee, the less effective the mentoring intervention will be in increasing outcomes.¹</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Mentors and mentees <strong>participate not only in academic, but also social activities</strong></td>
<td>Mentoring for youth with academic challenges that took place during schools hours had less positive (and at times negative) effects on academic performance. Mentoring out of school time (at lunch or after school) had positive effects on academics.⁶</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Mentees are afforded opportunities for self-determination¹</td>
<td>Conversely, multiple studies show the positive academic effects found from mentoring interventions.⁷</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Clearly explain to teachers, parents, and other partners that **the goal of the mentoring is not teaching or tutoring, but mentoring and relationship development that can support educational outcomes.⁷</td>
<td>It was found that mentoring relationships for youth with challenges in the school setting positively impacted academic success, including increased GPA, fewer disciplinary referrals, improved school attendance, more involvement in class, greater connections with teachers, more commitment to academics, increased chances of graduating, and greater feelings of belonging at school.¹³⁴⁵</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Mentee Referral, Selection & Training | When advertising the program, emphasize academic and career support as opposed to relational support. This may attract more people who are uncomfortable with the idea of personal relationships.¹

Assess the mentee to determine what factors are influencing their academic difficulties, so those factors can be addressed during the mentoring intervention.¹,⁷ |

| Mentor Recruitment, Screening & Selection | Mentors who have experience in education or other helping professions should be targeted for recruitment.¹ |

| Mentor Training | **Mentor training should include:**

- Clarifying that the mentor role is not to be a teacher or tutor;
- Learning how to work collaboratively with their mentee, and acting with authenticity and empathy;
- **Understanding factors that influence academic performance, including learning styles and needs;**
- Practicing solving problems the mentee may experience at school;
- Reading the mentee and assessing the challenges they are having and how that might impact the relationship; and
- How to connect with parents and caregivers.¹,⁷ |

For tips about how to establish a mentoring relationship for youth with academic challenges can be found in *Making the Grade.*⁷
| Matching Process | Mentors who share life experiences with their mentees may be seen as more credible and thus developing relationships with their mentees may be easier.  
Allow mentees to choose mentors or ensure they are matched based on shared academic/career interests.  

| Mentoring Relationship Development | **Mentors can support a young person struggling with academic challenges through a developmental approach** by:  
a. Beginning with relationship development and then adding academic activities as needed, as school may be a sensitive issue;  
b. Using collaborative decision-making so the young person feels they have agency;  
c. Doing fun activities with their mentees;  
d. Connecting their mentees to academic support services;  
e. Working with school staff and parents to identify the mentee's assets;  
f. Building their tutoring and academic assistance skills; and  
g. Including career exploration and volunteering into the mentoring process can help the mentee set career goals and thus become more engaged in learning related to those goals.  

Mentors’ attitudes and beliefs are tied to outcomes for youth. Mentors who believe they are capable of helping, have positive attitudes toward youth, and are interested in self-improvement are more likely to be successful in supporting positive outcomes for their mentees.  

Refer to *Making the Grade* for ideas about mentoring activities for youth with academic challenges.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Match Supervision, Support &amp; Retention</th>
<th>Staff should check in with mentees regularly and ask about the relationship. By recognizing challenges and celebrating successes, staff can help mentors feel more competent and can increase outcomes. It should be noted, however, that if emphasis is placed on academics the young person may feel pressured about their academic achievement.(^1,7)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Parent/ Caregiver/ Family Involvement | Facilitating an orientation for parents/guardians can help them understand the goals of the program, how they can support the work of the mentor, and basic strategies to support their child’s academic development.\(^7\)  
Involving parents in mentoring can support the growth of the mentoring relationship and thus increase the positive academic outcomes.\(^1\) |
| References | Literature Reviews:  
Individual Studies:  
Indigenous Youth

Key Lessons

- Mentoring for Indigenous youth should emphasize cultural appropriateness by:
  - Conducting a needs assessment to ensure the program design is a fit for the community;
  - Involving community members, including Elders and family members;
  - Establishing an advisory committee to oversee planning and program activities;
  - Providing cross-cultural training for staff and mentors; and
  - Supporting and encouraging mentors and mentees to participate in cultural activities.

- Garnering community support for mentoring may be more difficult with Indigenous communities due to previous experiences of colonization and marginalization. Additionally, mentoring staff should work diligently to promote reciprocal relationships that breakdown any power imbalances.

- Mentors should receive training in community specific issues (e.g., intergenerational impacts of residential schools) so they can best support their mentees.

“Grandmothers, Elders themselves, are teachers. They’re older, and they have more knowledge, and they’ve been through a lot more experiences and can teach younger ones -- future generations.” (Big Brothers Big Sisters of Canada Youth In Care Focus Groups)

Existing Toolkits & Resources

Guidelines for mentoring with First Nation, Métis, and/or Inuit communities:
http://albertamentors.ca/create-a-mentoring-program/tools-for-mentoring-in-aboriginal-communities/

Engaging and empowering Aboriginal youth: A toolkit for service providers:
http://master.fnbc.info/sites/default/files/resourcefiles/Engaging and Empowering Aboriginal Youth - Toolkit for Service Providers_0.pdf

Other Sources:

## Effective Mentoring for Indigenous Youth

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Standards &amp; Good Practices (linked to positive outcomes for participants)</th>
<th>Other Pertinent Info (from other studies &amp; reports)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Program Planning           | Some tips for making programs more culturally appropriate for Indigenous youth:  
1. **Involve Indigenous community members (including Elders)** in program planning, implementation, and evaluation.  
2. **Setup an advisory committee** to oversee the program and ensure cultural appropriateness of program design and activities.  
3. **Conduct a needs assessment to ensure the program is a good fit for the community** and if so, that it is designed with the community’s traditions, needs and interests in mind.  
4. **Provide cross-cultural training for staff and mentors** facilitated by Elders.  
5. **Include group and one-on-one mentoring models.**  
6. **Provide cultural teachings**, such as using native languages and customs as part of the programs (e.g. sharing circles and the medicine wheel).  
7. **Involve family and extended family members.**  

If implementing online mentoring for Indigenous youth, there are some factors which can help lead to success:  
- Open relationship founded on trust and respect.  
- Mentors and mentees connect regularly.  
- Responding to messages in a timely fashion.  
- Having face-to-face meetings where possible.  

Mentoring programs should not operate as independent initiatives, but should be embedded within other programs and operate in conjunction with other community projects. Program leaders should be aware that if there are already programs that provide support and guidance to youth, an additional service (especially if facilitated by outside organizations) may be seen as unnecessary.  

Group mentoring may be more culturally appropriate than one-on-one mentoring.  

Although, the term mentoring is not typically used in Indigenous communities, there is a cultural practice in many communities where older community members actively support younger members.  

If programming will be based in schools, assess whether the Board and school community align with your organization’s values. See example in *Engaging and Empowering Aboriginal Youth Toolkit*.  

**Youth in northern Canadian communities have limited access to formal mentoring programs, thus e-mentoring may be a promising model** for this population as it reduces barriers related to distance between mentors and mentees. E-mentoring can also minimize power dynamics because visible
When approaching community members and Elders, mentoring program staff should follow appropriate protocol. Programs should consider the following when partnering with Indigenous organizations/communities:

- Relationships take time to develop.
- Acknowledge conflicting priorities.
- Make partnerships a priority from beginning of process, e.g. using partners to support designing plan and program and then applying to funding.
- Commit to overcoming challenges that may arise.
- Be realistic about timelines and give partners plenty of time for reflection.
- Select partners that have strong relationships in the community and needed expertise.
- Make a conscious effort to include the voice of youth and women in your partnerships.
- Ensure you have a basic understanding of political, cultural, and community issues.
- Use varying forms of communication for different groups.
- Clarify expectations of partner involvement.
- Develop strategies for working with parents and guardians.\textsuperscript{5, 9}

Engage with community throughout the program by:

- Connecting with family members regularly;
- Hosting open houses and community celebrations with food for families, Elders, and community members; and
- Asking parents to observe/participate in activities.\textsuperscript{7, 8}

Hire a person from Indigenous communities to

Indigenous communities may be more wary of mentoring programs due to previous experiences of colonization and marginalization at the hand of Eurocentric initiatives. Similarly, programs should be cautious of targeting specific communities for mentoring as this can lead to further stigmatization of a group.\textsuperscript{4, 10}

For example of mentoring programs for Indigenous youth see \textit{Engaging and empowering Aboriginal youth}.\textsuperscript{9}

Refer to \textit{Handbook for Aboriginal Mentoring Checklist} for Developing an Indigenous Mentoring Program.\textsuperscript{8}

Marginalization cannot be seen. Due to the “irregular pace” of online mentoring, it has been found to be less effective that in-person mentoring.\textsuperscript{6}

Due to the “irregular pace” of online mentoring, it has been found to be less effective.
coordinate the program. If not possible, hire a person who has worked with Indigenous communities and is respected by the community.\textsuperscript{7,10}

| Program Implementation | Implementing programs for Indigenous youth requires particular attention to cultural needs and combatting marginalization. Staff should consider:  
• Implementing a wide range of activities;  
• Incorporating cultural wisdom to create a strengths-based and more holistic approach;  
• Using appropriate language. If you’re not sure about what terminology to use, ask participants and community partners for their preferences;  
• Acknowledging roots of particular cultural practices, especially when combining traditions; and  
• Establishing goals based on the interests and needs of the individual mentee as traditional mentoring is based on Western values, thus it is not always most appropriate for Indigenous youth and a more power-balanced model should be used.\textsuperscript{3,5,9,10}  

Some suggest that informal/natural mentoring is the most successful mentoring model for Indigenous youth.\textsuperscript{5} |

| Mentoring can present challenges in an Indigenous context because the mentor-mentee role sets up a power imbalance, which can reinforce deep rooted cultural conflicts.\textsuperscript{5}  
A New Zealand study found that only 21% of mentoring programs for Maori youth were deemed to be highly culturally appropriate for the mentees. Programs that are not culturally appropriate have been found to be less effective.\textsuperscript{1}  
Mentoring for Indigenous youth can help with passing on traditional values/cultural teachings, respect for Elders, and build a sense of pride for one’s culture.\textsuperscript{8,10} |

| Mentee Referral, Selection & Training | Youth need to see themselves reflected in the program, for example, use posters that depict Indigenous youth.\textsuperscript{9} |

Programs should target mentees who are experiencing many barriers and do not currently have any natural mentors.\textsuperscript{8,10} |
| Mentor Recruitment, Screening & Selection | When recruiting mentors for mentoring programs with Indigenous communities:  
   a. Have community partners/advisory committee review mentor screening tools to ensure they are appropriate for the cultural/community context.  
   b. Limit information collected from candidates when applying to be a mentor.  
   c. Build relationships with mentor candidates.  
   d. Work with community partners to recruit/screen.  
   e. Be open to having Indigenous mentors who may have past experiences with harmful substance use or the criminal justice system. A protocol should be established to support these individuals in becoming mentors.  
[4, 7] |
| Mentor Training | Mentor training should include knowledge about:  
   a. How to work with Elders;  
   b. Cultural competency;  
   c. How to work with Indigenous families;  
   d. Issues specific to the community (such as, understanding of FAS/FAE, child abuse and neglect, gang activities, and residential schools);  
   e. Basic counselling techniques; and  
   f. Program expectations.  
[2, 5, 9] |
| Matching Process | Mentoring relationships are more successful when the mentors and mentees have similar values, interests, and backgrounds. There can also be benefits to having providing mentors of the same race and socioeconomic status. For Indigenous mentees, having Indigenous mentors can support them in cultural teachings.  
[2, 5, 8] |
| | For matches participating in e-mentoring, shared ethnicity and gender is much less important than shared values and interests.  
[6] |
| | Mentoring relationships in Indigenous communities may be more successful if they emphasize a reciprocal relationship where both the mentor and mentee can learn from one another.  
[8] |
| Mentoring Relationship Development | Mentors for Indigenous youth can support relationship development by:  
• Helping mentees address challenges and meeting goals through collaborative problem solving rather than imposing solutions;  
• Fostering an environment where mentees are involved in decision making and have a choice about the level of involvement with their mentors;  
• Building trust with mentees by being non-judgmental and consistent;  
• Recognizing mentees for their strengths and achievements; and  
• Having a sense of humour as Indigenous children are generally responsive to people who are fun and funny.⁵, ⁸, ⁹, ¹⁰ |  |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Parent/ Caregiver/ Family Involvement</td>
<td>It is important to connect with community stakeholders to ensure parents know about the program and can refer their children.⁸</td>
<td>Awareness of Indigenous family dynamics is important for non-Indigenous mentors to help them better understand the cultural needs of their mentees.⁵</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| SPECIAL CONSIDERATION: Other Best Practices from Culturally Appropriate Programs for Indigenous Youth | “There are culturally specific protective factors for Indigenous individuals:  
• Traditional culture and values, including spirituality.  
• Access to community Elders.  
• Increased cultural emphasis on specific protective factors – such as health families and strong community networks” (p. 7).⁹ | Feeling culturally disconnected is a risk factor for Indigenous individuals to be involved with violence.⁹ |

Avoid tokenism of Indigenous youth and instead provide meaningful opportunities for engagement and contributing to planning—move toward using youth-led strategies when possible. One strategy that supports meaningful engagement is meeting the youth “where

4 Principles for successful programming for Indigenous youth:  
• Understanding and integrating cultural identity (loss of culture is a risk factor)  
• Increasing youth engagement  
• Fostering youth empowerment (including helping youth learn to use these skills to promote social change)  
• Establishing and maintaining effective partnerships (more important for Indigenous programs)⁹ |
Be aware that one youth’s voice cannot be representative of ALL perspectives.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>References</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Systematic Reviews:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Individual Studies:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Other Sources:</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Racialized Youth

Key Lessons

- Traditional mentoring models may need to be modified and updated to best support racialized youth. Mentoring programs should ensure youth are learning culturally and racially appropriate coping skills, which can help in developing a positive ethnic and racial identity.
- Mentor matching for racialized youth is a contentious issue – some believe that cross-race matching may result in further marginalization, whereas others believe that shared values and interests are more important than shared racial identities. When matching racialized youth, the following factors should be considered:
  - What preferences does the mentee and mentee’s family have for matching?
  - Does the mentee have same-race role models elsewhere?
  - What is the mentee’s level of cultural mistrust? How can you support them in exploring discrimination and oppression?

---

Existing Toolkits


---


- Does the mentee have a strong ethnic identity?
- What is the cultural competency of the mentor and the organization?

* Programs should be open to engaging mentors from various backgrounds and experiences, including those who may have been through hard times and are interested in taking a strong leadership role with youth. Additional training may be required for these individuals.

To the right is a *Body Map* of racialized youth prepared by participants (service providers) during a training day by the Ontario Mentoring Coalition.

**Existing Tools & Resources**

Since they originate from the United States, most resources on mentoring racialized youth refer to African Americans in particular.


## Effective Mentoring for Racialized Youth

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Standards &amp; Good Practices (linked to positive outcomes for participants)</th>
<th>Other Pertinent Info (from other studies &amp; reports)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Program Implementation Strategies</td>
<td>Mentoring programs that have components specifically tailored to participants’ culture can facilitate positive ethnic and racial identity formation. Using a strengths-based approach is preferable when working with racialized youth.</td>
<td>Minority youth are less likely to have natural mentors and thus may be in greater need for formal mentoring programs. Youth perception of teacher support, school belonging, and decision-making has been found to improve with mentoring. Mentoring was also found to limit involvement with school discipline system.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Mentor Recruitment, Screening & Selection | 10 Strategies for recruiting Black men to be mentors:  
• Make sure African American men are active in the organization (on staff and Board of Directors)  
• Be creative about outreach- attend community events  
• Make the space friendly for Black men, | Ex-prisoners can be excellent mentors because they have “street cred” and may be passionate about working with Black men. Specialized training may be needed if they will be involved with formal mentoring. Barriers to Black males becoming mentors:  
1. Desire to be mentored themselves |
including ensuring African American men are reflected in print and web photos associated with the program
- Use emotional branding - tell potential mentors that they can make a difference!
- Clarify the expectations around length of commitment and number of regular hours required
- Partner with community groups to recruit mentors and involve community leaders where possible
- Use one-on-one recruitment where possible
- Outreach to diverse groups of men - considering men with criminal records
- Engage potential mentors immediately and follow up where necessary
- Retain mentors by providing ongoing support and training, supporting groups of mentors in bonding, provide incentives (honoraria where possible), acknowledge their role

Advocacy is a key skill for mentors and can result in more effective programming.¹

Provide cultural competency training for mentors to help mentors in developing empathy for their mentees.²,⁴

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Matching Process</th>
<th>When deciding about whether to do a same-race or cross-race match, consider these factors:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Consider preferences for racial similarity in matches, look for similarities elsewhere, consider same-race matches for mentees with few same-race role models</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Assess the mentee’s level of cultural mistrust and</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>One study by Rhodes (2002) found that of 476 youth mentoring relationships (most of which were from racialized groups) found very few differences between same race and cross race matches.⁷ Additionally, varying results have been found about whether having practitioners with the same ethnic background impacts outcomes.⁴</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Cultural competency is not static and thus mentors can learn and enhance their skills over time.⁶
provide a safe space to discuss discrimination and oppression

• Assess mentee ethnic identity and consider matching youth with weaker ethnic identity with mentor with a strong ethnic identity
• Examine cultural competence of mentor and organization

Mentors who share life experiences with their mentees may be seen as more credible and thus developing relationships with their mentees may be easier. For racialized mentees, it is more important that the mentor has cultural competency rather than be of the same race. This can help the mentee develop a strong ethnic identity, which can help combat barriers and systemic oppression due to race.¹,²

Program staff can support cross-race matches by:

• Helping the mentors understand their own biases;
• Providing mentors with ongoing training about cultural competency, relationship development skills (authenticity, conflict management, empowerment, etc.), maintaining commitments to their mentee, and allowing the mentee to direct activities and goal-setting;
• Teaching the mentors to support the mentee in learning about their heritage and celebrate the ethnic identity of their mentee; and
• Supporting the mentor in learning to provide feedback in a positive way.³,⁸,⁹

Youth perception of a mentor’s similarity in values and interests are more strongly related to positive mentoring experiences.³,⁴

The following arguments provide support for same-race matching:

• Black mentees who interact with Black mentors who have achieved success in their life can have greater academic achievement.
• Cross-race matches may not be effective because if the mentor cannot understand the struggles the youth has faced they may not be able to provide the same level of guidance and support as a mentor who has experienced the same racial discrimination.
• Cross-race matching can perpetuate systemic oppression if the mentor imposes their cultural values on the youth.
• Racialized people are often more likely to live in impoverished communities, which are more likely to experience violence. If a mentor has experienced violence as well, this can help the young person heal.
• When seeking natural mentors, youth are more likely to select mentors of similar backgrounds-ethnicity, race and gender. This may be due to perceived similarities.¹,²,³,⁵,⁹

Conversely, research has found support for cross-race matching:

1. If same-race mentoring relationships occur, mentees may have difficulty having hope for the future due to systemic racism.
| Match Supervision, Support & Retention | Providing mentors and supporters with compensation can help with mentor retention and increase capacity and outcomes.⁷,¹⁰ | 2. Mentors may be more effective when they have overcome challenges and mentees can relate to them—this can provide inspiration and hope for the future.

3. One study found that mentees felt they could talk more openly with their mentors.

4. Cross-race matches may be a necessity, so that a child does not have to be on a waiting list for a mentor of the same race. Timing is more important than the race of the mentor.

5. Parents had more positive impressions of cross-race matches.

6. Some mentees felt that cultural differences helped them become closer with their mentors.

7. Race may affect relationships more when combined with other factors, such as gender, personality, parent attitudes, etc.¹,⁴,⁸,⁹ |

| SPECIAL CONSIDERATION: Mentoring Black Boys | Programs shown to be effective for working with Black boys focus on improving the future of the youth—e.g., focus on education, employment goals, leadership skills, incorporating African languages/symbols, etc.¹,¹⁰

The role of Black women in mentoring programs for boys should be encouraged and recognized.¹⁰

Work with existing advocates to refer youth to mentoring and support the process once they are enrolled.¹² | Traditional mentoring models may not be most appropriate for Black boys. Black youth could benefit from building culturally and racially appropriate coping skills to help reduce the effects of discrimination.¹,⁵

Black youth in care may require special attention due to the lack of public role models from their community.¹

Mentoring programs for Black youth often require more funding than traditional mentoring programs and due to funding constraints many youth who need support may not receive it.¹ |
Miller (2008) included quotations from key leaders in mentoring for Black youth:

1. “Mentoring is critical if we intend to address much of the pain, abuse, and abandonment that African American males suffer from” (p. 1).
2. “It’s imperative that our young brothers know that we care. If we don’t educate, encourage, motivate, and inspire our youth, who will?” (p. 8).  

E-mentoring for Black men can enhance feelings of belonging and increase motivation. It also provides youth access to caring Black role models who they may otherwise not have the opportunity to connect with.  

References

Systematic Reviews:


Literature Reviews:


Individual Studies:
Newcomer Youth

Key Lessons

- Developing and planning a mentoring program for newcomer youth should include:
  - Consulting with the community through an advisory committee or needs assessment process;
  - Understanding the particular challenges related to the community’s transition to their new country;
  - Hiring staff from the community or those who have a strong understanding of the community;
  - Reviewing program materials regularly to ensure cultural appropriateness; and

---


Other Sources:


• Supporting past mentees in becoming mentors.
  • Programs should include family members in mentoring as much as possible to help the youth balance learning about their new culture and maintaining previous cultural values and norms.
  • Mentors should receive training in various community-specific issues, such as the immigration process (and its challenges), trauma (mental and physical issues), and cultural competency.

Here is a Body Map of newcomer youth prepared by participants (service providers) during a training day by the Ontario Mentoring Coalition.

Existing Tools & Resources
Mentoring Immigrant & Refugee Youth:

Tool for Mentoring Immigrant Communities:
http://albertamentors.ca/create-a-mentoring-program/tools-for-mentoring-immigrant-communities/
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Standards &amp; Good Practices (linked to positive outcomes for participants)</th>
<th>Other Pertinent Info (from other studies &amp; reports)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Program Planning | When **developing a program** for newcomer youth it is important for program staff to:  
- **Consult with the community** you will be serving and give a voice to community leaders to understand specific assets, needs, and challenges. This can be done through development of an advisory committee and/or conducting a needs assessment;  
- **Listen and understand the context surrounding the community’s transition** to their new country;  
- **Prioritize hiring staff who are from the community** you will be serving or have a strong understanding of the community;  
- **Review program materials regularly to ensure cultural appropriateness and diminish any bias**; and  
- **Use a mentoring model that allows mentees to become mentors** can support the young person’s acculturation and pass on skills and tools to future newcomer youth.³⁹¹¹ | Programs should consider designing the program to impact the challenging context which newcomers are experiencing, e.g., mentoring programs can work to address issues newcomer youth experience in their school cultures.³  
Support from schools and communities is essential for the success of mentoring programs.²  
Examples of mentoring programs for newcomer youth:  
- [http://www.the519.org/programs/newcomer-youth-mentorship](http://www.the519.org/programs/newcomer-youth-mentorship)  
- [http://www.kidsnewtocanada.ca/health-promotion/youth-resources](http://www.kidsnewtocanada.ca/health-promotion/youth-resources)  
- [http://www.cbfy.ca/program-main/mentorship-program/](http://www.cbfy.ca/program-main/mentorship-program/)  
- [http://thepeerproject.com](http://thepeerproject.com)  
Refer to **Mentoring Immigrant and Refugee Youth** for tips and training tools for staff working with newcomer children.¹¹ |
| Program Implementation | Two types of mentoring may be useful for newcomer/first generation youth:  
1. Instrumental- focus on supporting newly immigrated youth in learning skills and expectations in new culture (e.g., language and cultural expectations/behaviours)  
2. Developmental- focus on supporting youth who have lived in the country for an extended period of time or are first generation youth in negotiating an identity based on more than one cultural experience/background.  

Program staff should learn as much as possible about the cultural background of their mentees by doing their own research and listening to each mentee to understand their own experiences better.  

Encouraging cultural activities from various backgrounds, including the mentee’s previous country and new home country, can help all participants appreciate cultural differences.  

Newcomer youth can benefit from positive social relationships which assist with assimilation and consequently decrease negative mental health outcomes.  

Increased access to mentors was associated with youth feeling more respected by adults.  

| Mentee Referral, Selection & Training | Mentoring programs for newcomers should only begin after the mentee has settled into their new country and their initial needs are met.  

Mentee recruitment materials should be available in multiple languages to ensure parents and caregivers are aware of the opportunity and can refer their children.  

| Mentor Recruitment, Screening & Selection | Determine what role you would like the mentors to play (e.g., language acquisition, emotional support, etc.).  

Tips to recruit mentors for newcomer mentoring |
| Mentor Training | Have community partners support development of the mentor training.\(^9\)  
**Mentor training** should include educating mentors about the following:  
- The **immigration process**;  
- The **negative impacts related to migrating to a new country** (e.g., separation from family members);  
- Other issues related to the community they will be working with;  
- **Trauma and other mental or physical health needs that the mentees may experience**; and  
- **Cultural competency**, so they can be empathetic and understanding mentors.\(^1,2,7,9,11\)  

**Mentors should be aware of the negative impact of early match termination, especially for newcomer youth many of whom have had to leave behind family members and friends.\(^1\)**  
| Matching Process | Same-race matching is not necessarily superior to cross-race matching for newcomer youth. **Cross-race matching can provide cross-cultural learning.**\(^3\)  
Mentors who share life experiences with their mentees  
| | One study found that youth who had cross-race mentors were less likely to perceive experiences of discrimination.\(^6\)  
Mentees who identified with multiple cultures were |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mentoring Relationship Development</th>
<th>May be seen as more credible and thus developing relationships with their mentees may be easier.(^1) More likely to seek support from their natural mentors, than those who felt assimilated in the community.(^6) Refer to <em>Mentoring Immigrant and Refugee Youth</em> for pros and cons of same gender/race/ethnic mentor matching.(^11)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mentoring Relationship Development</td>
<td>Building trust is the most important element of mentoring for newcomer youth.(^8) Mutual cultural understandings are an important part of relationship development for mentors and mentees.(^3) A peer mentoring program with newcomers from China found that they had statistically significantly increased peer attachment and trust.(^6) <em>Traditional mentoring programs focus on mentoring relationships developing based on personal disclosures; this may not be an approach that is appropriate for individuals from different cultures.</em> Asian youth who are less acculturated may be less likely to disclose about personal details, and as such, mentors should be open to forming relationships in ways that are comfortable for their mentees.(^5)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parent/ Caregiver/ Family Involvement</td>
<td>Engage with community throughout the program by: • Connecting with family members regularly; • Hosting open houses and community celebrations with food for families, and community members; and • Asking parents to observe/participate in activities.(^9) It is important to engage the family for refugee children in mentoring programs due to the often collectivist experience of refugees.(^3) <em>Including family in the mentoring process can help the mentee balance learning about their new community/cultural norms and maintaining their previous family/cultural values.</em>(^1,4) The mentor’s engagement with the family can not only help the mentee’s development, but also support the family.(^10)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parent/ Caregiver/ Family Involvement</td>
<td><em>Keep parents informed about the program- ensure materials are translated and you provide lots of pictures for those who may have literacy issues.</em>(^11)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\(^1\)\(^2\)\(^3\)\(^4\)\(^5\)\(^6\)\(^7\)\(^8\)\(^9\)\(^10\)\(^11\)
### References

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Systematic Reviews:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Literature Reviews:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Individual Studies:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Other Sources:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>


Youth with Developmental & Other Disabilities

Key Lessons

- Mentoring programs can support youth with disabilities by:
  - Using accommodations so mentors and mentees of different abilities can participate in the program activities;
  - Providing ongoing training to mentors and mentees about disability-related issues;
  - Supporting mentors in working with the particular needs of their mentees while maintaining a strengths-based approach;
  - Developing confidentiality policies and procedures for addressing disclosures;
  - Preparing a budget that includes costs for accessibility services; and
- Allowing mentees to have a choice in the program activities.
- Mentors should have training in safe interactions for youth with physical and mental challenges, establishing boundaries, and disability etiquette.
- There are many benefits to matching youth to mentors with similar abilities, such as developing confidence, learning about adaptive technologies, normalizing the disability, and creating a strong disability identity.
- E-mentoring is a promising practice for youth with disabilities as it may make connecting easier and reduce stigma.

"I would say that my disability is a pretty big barrier. Most mentors, not all mentors are not familiar with the challenges and the yeah- challenges that having a disability could bring, so I find it’s more difficult to find a mentor on that level. Um, a mentor that’s comfortable talking about disability, and constantly being around disability, ‘cause I find a lot of people can be awkward about it almost -- they don’t know what to say, or do." (Big Brothers Big Sisters of Canada Youth In Care Focus Groups)
Existing Tools & Resources
The Best Practices Guide in Mentoring Youth with Disabilities:

Mentoring 101: An introductory workshop for new mentors:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Standards &amp; Good Practices (linked to positive outcomes for participants)</th>
<th>Other Pertinent Info (from other studies &amp; reports)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Program Planning    | Interventions for youth with disabilities should be person-centred by emphasizing assets, fostering independence and developing a positive disability identity.\(^1\)  
When developing a mentoring program for youth with disabilities, staff should:  
- Use accommodations to support full inclusion of mentors and mentees with disabilities, e.g., on program/agency website, paper materials, meeting locations, and procedures.  
- Receive ongoing disability-related training.  
- Ensure mentors have the capacity to handle their mentees’ particular abilities.  
- Consider confidentiality and how disclosure issues will be handled.  
- Support the mentors in acknowledging challenges associated with the mentees’ disabilities while also operating from a strengths-based approach.  
- Plan for extra costs that may be incurred for accessibility services.\(^2,9\) | Many youth mentoring programs have overlooked inclusion of youth with disabilities, so if wanting to provide mentoring for youth with disabilities new programs do not necessarily need to be developed. However, there are strategies that can enhance current programs to make them more accessible.\(^9\)  
Successful mentoring programs should be setup to have positive impacts for everyone involved- mentors, mentees, parents/caregivers, program staff, and community partners.\(^2\)  
Refer to Mentoring Youth with Disabilities article for examples of mentoring programs in the US for youth with disabilities.\(^8\)  
Refer to The Best Practices Guide in Mentoring Youth with Disabilities for examples of mentoring programs for youth with disabilities, best practices for implementing a mentoring program, resources, sustainability information, evaluation, etc.\(^9\) |
| Program Implementation | Differently abled young people should have a say in their treatment/intervention activities to ensure they are relevant to interests and needs. This will also foster independence and self-determination and help youth feel more able and competent.\(^1, 5\)
Program advertising materials should be in multiple formats which make the material more accessible, e.g. braille, large print.\(^9\) | Research about youth with disabilities has found they are vulnerable to negative outcomes:
- Youth with disabilities are less likely to graduate high school, continue to post-secondary education, receive employment, and move onto independent living than their able bodied counterparts.
- Differently abled youth are more likely to have lower self-esteem, which can make it difficult to create and sustain relationships.
- Youth with disabilities are more likely to experience sedentary lifestyles and other physical health challenges.\(^1, 3, 11\)

Mentoring can provide **positive outcomes** for youth with disabilities:
- Youth with disabilities who have mentors who share these experiences are more likely to develop **self-efficacy** more quickly.
- Youth who had mentors that lived independently with disabilities were more likely to **learn, observe, and practice strategies for independent living from their mentors.**
- Mentors help youth with feeling connected to their communities which is very important for differently able mentees who typically have greater difficulty forming strong, lasting relationships.\(^3, 5\)

Mentoring is particularly helpful for youth with disabilities transitioning from school to work.\(^12\) |

<p>| Mentee Referral, Selection &amp; Training | Programs should openly state that they will accept youth with disabilities.(^2) |  |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Connecting with special education schools and departments, parent advisory groups, health care providers, and other social service organizations can help with recruiting.</td>
<td><strong>Mentee training</strong> should include establishing boundaries with the mentors, disclosure of disability-related issues, mandatory reporting about abuse/ neglect, and responsibilities and expectations of mentors and mentees.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Connecting with local employers, Independent Living Centers, rehabilitation programs, and disability organization can help to recruit mentors with disabilities.</td>
<td>Mentor training for youth with disabilities should include:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Mentor training</strong> for youth with disabilities should include:</td>
<td>- Overview of program expectations and <strong>how to promote safe and positive experiences</strong>;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Communication skills and how to provide feedback;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- <strong>Establishing boundaries</strong> with the mentees;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- <strong>Disclosure of disability-related issues</strong>;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Reporting procedures for abuse/neglect;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Responsibilities and expectations of mentors and mentees;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Diversity and disability issues, including <strong>disability etiquette</strong>; and</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Consider having a local disability agency come to deliver a presentation.</td>
<td>Ensure training location is physically accessible and/or provide training online to make it accessible for</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

See *Mentoring 101: An Introductory Workshop for New Mentors* for a comprehensive manual about training mentors working with youth with disabilities.
| Mentoring Relationship Development | **Matching individuals with similar abilities can help the young person:**  
- Experience a positive role model who is similar to them, which may help in developing confidence and feeling more able.  
- Learn about adaptive technologies used for independent living and new activities in which they could participate.  
- Normalize the disability.  
- **Developing a strong identity,** which encompasses their disability.  
Matching mentors and mentees based on proximity to one another to make meeting up easier was a strategy used by the *I Can Do It, You Can Do It* program.  
If matching based on similar disability there could end up being a waiting list for youth in order to find an appropriate mentor.  
| **Regular meetings should be established as part of the program, so that youth with disabilities (who are particularly vulnerable to relationship challenges) do not withdraw from the relationship.**  
One program provided mentees with incentives to working on and achieving their goals.  
Host mentoring activities that are accessible and at locations that are physically accessible.  
| **Parent/ Caregiver/ Family Involvement** | Staff should parental inclusion in mentoring programs by:  
- Requiring them to sign consent forms and assent to disclosure about their child’s disability; |
| SPECIAL CONSIDERATION: E-Mentoring | Mentoring websites should have accessibility features built-in.²  

E-mentoring can be effective for use in mentoring youth with disabilities because they provide a safe place for youth with disabilities to connect with mentors and may better accommodate communication challenges posed by disabilities, reduce challenges associated with travelling, and any health concerns.⁹,¹²  

Face-to-face meetings can enhance an e-mentoring approach.⁴  

Mentor should be screened as thoroughly for online mentoring as for in-person mentoring.⁹  

Mentors studying social work related disciplines were more likely to be successful.⁷  

Relationships where mentors and mentees communicated more regularly and both mentor and mentee were open (e.g., disclosed their disability) were more likely to be successful.⁷  

| E-mentoring reduces the stigma associated with disabilities because they are not physically apparent.⁴  

E-mentoring can help reduce the communication challenges associated with in-person for those with limitations associated with their disabilities.⁴,⁹,¹²  

Online mentoring was less successful when the mentor’s first email was more formal and less friendly.⁷  

Connecting to Success, DO-IT, and Partners Online are examples of online mentoring programs for youth with disabilities.²,⁴,⁹  

| References | Literature Reviews:  


²Providing opportunities for parents to give insight about how to make the program successful and safe for their child; and  

• Providing opportunities to learn from the mentors how to help their child self-advocate.²,⁵,⁹
Individual Studies:


Other Sources:


## Key Lessons

- Less information is available on effective mentoring for youth with mental health needs. This is a clear gap in our current understanding of best practices in mentoring.
- Providing mentoring as part of a treatment plan and/or in conjunction with mental health professionals is preferable. Youth with mental health needs may have unique experiences, assets, and challenges that go beyond the capacity of the mentor (Kerr & King, 2013; Leahy & Robb, 2013; Rosenberg, 2008).
- Mentors should understand that their role is to provide support and friendship – as opposed to being counsellors – as they are not trained mental health professionals (Leahy & Robb, 2013).
- Mentors may require more intensive training based on the needs of their mentee, including how to respond to crisis situations (Kerr & King, 2013)

## Existing Tools & Resources

Building a better school environment for youth with mental health and addiction issues:


---


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Standards &amp; Good Practices (linked to positive outcomes for participants)</th>
<th>Other Pertinent Info (from other studies &amp; reports)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Program Planning</td>
<td><strong>Mentoring interventions should be offered in conjunction with current treatment plans</strong> for youth with mental health needs as opposed to replacing those services; coordinating mentoring efforts with a</td>
<td>A peer mentorship program for youth with mental health needs was recommended by a youth advisory committee on mental health.⁶</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Program Implementation | Youth with mental health needs may require more intensive support in mentoring, so **mentors should be screened carefully** to ensure they have the skills, are committed to the role and understand the expectations of the program to ensure the young person does not experience further rejection.¹

Youth with mental health needs may not be well suited to a group mentoring model as youth with higher needs may require more attention from their mentors, thus one-on-one mentoring is recommended.¹

Formal peer mentoring models for youth with mental health needs are not recommended.¹

**Some positive findings have been uncovered by research about youth with mental health needs, namely:**

- Psychosocial outcomes for youth with no previous diagnosed issues are more likely to be positive if the individual had a natural (non-parent) mentor.
- One study’s outcomes indicated that “natural mentoring relationships moderate the relationship between stress and depression” (p. 44).
- Mentors can help youth experiencing mental health needs by advocating for them, supporting them to begin treatment, and ensuring they adhere to and stay in treatment.
- Transitioning to adulthood can be very stressful and challenging for youth who have mental health or substance use issues. These challenges can be mitigated by having support of an adult role model who can help them with decision-making and problem solving.¹³⁴

| Traditional models of mentoring programs cannot necessarily meet the needs of youth involved with or leaving the mental health system.¹

Refer to *Youth with Mental Health Needs* resource for examples of mentoring programs for youth with mental health needs.¹ | | |

| Mentor Recruitment, Screening & Selection | Mentors should be screened carefully to ensure they have the skills, are committed to the role and understand the expectations of the program to ensure the young person does not experience further rejection.¹ |

Mentors for youth with mental health needs could benefit from **more intensive training than typical mentoring programs** and access to the contacts for | | |

| Mentor Training | | |

| | | |
emergency mental health services and program staff in case they need to support during crises.¹

During training, the role of mentors should be clearly explained, so that mentors (who are not trained mental health professionals) do not feel they have to provide counselling for their mentees.⁶

Mental health issues may emerge throughout the time in the program, so mentors should receive ongoing crisis intervention to support their mentees through these issues.⁵

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Matching Process</th>
<th>Mentors who share life experiences with their mentees may be seen as more credible and thus developing relationships with their mentees may be easier.²</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Mentoring Relationship Development | The most supportive mentoring relationships for youth with mental health needs were characterized by:  
1. Consistency and availability  
2. Connectedness and caring  
3. Empathy  
4. Meaningful conversations  
5. Reciprocal relationships  
6. Complete acceptance  
7. Emotional support to help manage symptoms  
8. Encouragement  
9. Informational support and advice⁵ |

| References | Literature Reviews:  

**Individual Studies:**


**Other Sources:**

LGBTTQQIP2SA Youth

“If you’re dealing with youths [who are] just transitioning into whatever choice of identity they want to have - they’re not actually there yet – a lot of times, they’re questioning it. So, having a little bit of background as to what they’re going through mentally, health wise, physically … even if you can’t physically help that youth do it, or whatever, at least you can have more insight, and get [them] the help that they do need if they’re going through a crisis. Whether it’s something that’s going through their head or something physical.” (Big Brothers Big Sisters of Canada Youth In Care Focus Groups)

Key Lessons

- Less information is available on effective mentoring for LGBTTQQIP2SA youth. This is a clear gap in our current understanding of best practices in mentoring.
- Program planning for LGBTTQQIP2SA youth should include:
  - Recruiting LGBTQ identified staff;
  - Developing anti-discrimination and confidentiality policies; and
  - Encouraging matches to participate in LGBTQ positive activities (Barajas, 2005).
- Mentor training for mentors working with LGBTTQQIP2SA youth should include understanding confidentiality, how to support youth with bullying/harassment, using inclusive language, responding to homophobia, and unpacking biases (Barajas, 2005; Big Sisters of BC Lower Mainland, n.d.; Jucovy, 2000; UR Pride Centre for Sexuality and Gender Diversity, 2013).
- Staff should be aware of local agencies that support LGBTQ youth and be willing to refer parents to these agencies (Barajas, 2005).

Existing Tools & Resources


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Standards &amp; Good Practices</th>
<th>Other Pertinent Info</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Program Planning</td>
<td>**Organization should have an anti-discrimination policy that explicitly mentions LGBTQQIP2SA issues.**⁹&lt;br&gt;Resources: <a href="http://www.mentoring.org/new-site/wp-content/uploads/2015/09/MAY_2015_List_of_Additional_Resources.pdf">http://www.mentoring.org/new-site/wp-content/uploads/2015/09/MAY_2015_List_of_Additional_Resources.pdf</a></td>
<td>Adults and youth are not well connected in some LGBTQQIP2SA communities and as such mentoring programs can create a safe space to bridge this gap.⁹,¹³&lt;br&gt;One study found that for a sample of LGBTQQIP2SA youth, only 16% had “accessible” role models (people in their lives, such as family members, teachers, etc.) versus 60% having “inaccessible” role models (e.g., celebrities). Additionally, younger LGBTQQIP2SA youth aged 16-19 years are more likely to report inaccessible mentors compared to older LGBTQQIP2SA youth 20-24 years old.³&lt;br&gt;Incorporating natural mentoring into programs for LGBTQQIP2SA youth could help increase the level of social support the youth feels and consequently, also reduce negative outcomes associated with identifying as LGBTQQIP2SA.⁸</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Program Implementation</td>
<td>Due to the stereotype that LGBTTQQIP2SA people are predatory, one program created clearly defined roles for adult-youth mentoring relationships to ensure wider community support and formalized procedures are in place. This includes screening, training and follow-up procedures for mentors. Gay or lesbian role models are more difficult to find due to the fact that a questioning youth’s parents are unlikely to share their identity. Thus mentoring can be a promising intervention to support younger LGBTTQQIP2SA people in feeling connected to those who have already come out and in building an LGBTTQQIP2SA identity. Group mentoring can be a better model for LGBTTQQIP2SA youth who are homeless or having chaotic living situations and cannot maintain a one-on-one mentoring relationship. LGBTTQQIP2SA youth usually develop natural mentoring relationships later than heterosexual youth and youth of colour are much less likely to have natural mentors at all. LGBTTQQIP2SA youth were as likely to be informally mentored by family members as school-based role models. Natural mentoring relationships between teachers and LGBTTQQIP2SA youth can help youth feel more connected and safe in their school communities. These relationships have also been shown to have positive effects on the likelihood of the mentees in attending post-secondary education. Examples of mentoring programs for LGBTTQQIP2SA youth: <a href="http://www.ourtruecolors.org/Mentoring/">http://www.ourtruecolors.org/Mentoring/</a> <a href="http://www.soytoronto.org/mentoring.html">http://www.soytoronto.org/mentoring.html</a></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mentee Referral, Selection &amp; Training</td>
<td>In the SOY mentoring program, trans youth are targeted for recruitment. This program also requires mentees to identify as LGBTTQQIP2SA or be questioning their sexual orientation or gender status.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| **Mentor Recruitment, Screening & Selection** | **Recruitment of LGBTTQQIP2SA mentors should be done through LGBTTQQIP2SA communities and agencies.** Mentors who are trans-identified should be specifically recruited. Additionally, mentors should not be excluded just because of a criminal record. The candidate should have a chance to contextualize any record.9, 13

SOY mentoring program volunteers must complete an application, attend the mentor training program, sign an agreement to maintain confidentiality, agree to a criminal reference check, and complete a medical history form in order to ensure the mentor has the physical capacity to adequately fulfill the role of mentor.13

If dealing with challenges, refer to the suggestions in *Mentoring Tactics.*9

Effective natural mentors provide:
- Social support
- Emotional support
- Informational support – providing information and advice (e.g., safer sex practices)
- Self-appraisal support – helping the person feel confident and accepting of themselves
- Unconditional support – accepting the person no matter what!8 |
| **Mentor Training** | **Mentor training** for LGBTTQQIP2SA youth should include:
- Helping mentors understand your policies on confidentiality – how and to whom should the mentor discuss issues related to their mentee coming out/ issues of harassment and bullying due to homophobia;
- Ensuring mentors keep the mentee’s sexual orientation confidential, even if it was disclosed to them because “outing” the mentee could cause damage to the mentee’s other relationships;
- Understanding and practicing inclusive language and not assuming which pronouns the youth would prefer. Program staff should inform mentors that |
they should use the terms that the youth uses;
• **Practicing how to respond to situations of homophobia** and how to provide advice to their mentee about experiences of homophobia; and
• **Unpacking their own biases.**  

Matching Process

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Consider specifically matching LGBTTQQIP2SA youth with LGBTTQQIP2SA adults or very supportive and understanding adult allies.⁹,¹¹</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Same-sex matching may not be the best option for LGBTTQQIP2SA youth- matching based on interests and other shared experiences may be more effective.⁶</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

LGBTTQQIP2SA teens and adults may feel disconnected from each other because their contexts of living a non-heteronormative lifestyle is very different. Additionally, LGBTTQQIP2SA adults must be cautious not to influence LGBTTQQIP2SA youth about how to take action in their lives and in advocating for issues that adults believe are important. The relationships should be supported by adults, rather than led by adults.⁴

LGBTTQQIP2SA adults should recognize that they can learn from LGBTTQQIP2SA youth. This is more proof that a reciprocal relationship can be supportive of the growth and development of both the mentor and mentee.⁴

Mentoring Relationship Development

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Due to the many challenges LGBTTQQIP2SA youth face with family dynamics, adults mentors may be involved with supporting their mentee in returning to school, seeking work, and finding housing.⁷</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mentors are not counsellors/ social workers, so if their mentee comes out to them they should consider utilizing external resources to support the mentee.¹⁰</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Activities that allow mentors and mentees to participate in LGBTTQQIP2SA positive activities should be planned/encouraged by the staff.⁹</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Mentoring relationships for LGBTTQQIP2SA youth can result in the match developing very close bonds where they are almost familial.¹¹

It is important that any hierarchy in relationships is diminished. **Positive mentoring programs for LGBTQ youth and adults are reciprocal** where both the mentor and mentee gain something from the relationships.¹¹,¹⁴

If a mentee discloses about their gender identity/ sexual orientation there are some things to remember when responding- see **Mentoring Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, and Transgender Youth.**⁹
is important to openly examine and discuss the stigma associated with that identity and problem solve any issues related to prejudice and discrimination.\textsuperscript{2}

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Match Supervision, Support &amp; Retention</th>
<th>Programs should check-in with mentors and mentees regularly to avoid participants feeling stressed or overwhelmed and do not burn out. Mentors should also participate in ongoing trainings.\textsuperscript{13, 14}</th>
<th>Mentor relationships must remain platonic and if they become romantic, the relationship should be formally ended.\textsuperscript{14}</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

| Parent/ Caregiver/ Family Involvement | The program and mentors can **support parents if their child comes out by listening and referring them to other support organizations.** If the program is designed to match LGBTTQQIP2SA adults with LGBTTQQIP2SA youth, be honest with the parents about the program design.\textsuperscript{9} | |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>References</th>
<th>Literature Reviews:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Individual Studies:</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Other Sources:


Youth In or Leaving Care

“Being able to maintain a stable and steady relationship with at least one person makes all the difference in the world. I’m sure if we can somehow fix things so children and youth in care can have a constant in their lives, someone who is there for them.” (Youth Leaving Care Hearings, Provincial Advocate for Children & Youth)

Key Lessons

• Screening should be more intensive for mentor candidates – mentors may benefit from having more professional skills. Programs should also be cautious to screen out mentor candidates who are assertive, reserved, looking to “save” or change the mentees, and/or unwilling to provide long-term support. Mentors may also benefit from more intensive training, including how to support youth with trauma-related issues and the importance of maintaining the relationship.
• Early match closures are a significant risk for this population due to the likelihood that mentees may move or face significant challenges. Therefore, staff support must help combat early match termination.
• Caution needs to be given to ending matches in a healthy way as mentees in the care system are more likely to have experiences of abandonment.
• E-mentoring is a promising model for youth in care as it can limit the disruptions associated with moving regularly.

Here is a Body Map of youth in or leaving care prepared by participants (service providers) during a training day by the Ontario Mentoring Coalition.
Existing Toolkits & Resources

Mentoring Youth In Care:

Kinnections Mentoring Program for Youth – Program Policies and Procedures Templates:
https://www.mcf.gov.bc.ca/foster/pdf/Kinnections_Template.pdf

Another Body Map of youth in or leaving care prepared by participants (service providers) during a training day by the Ontario Mentoring Coalition.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Standards &amp; Good Practices</th>
<th>Other Pertinent Info</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Program Planning</td>
<td>Conducting a social network map of supporters and service providers for youth in care can help in understanding how people are connected and give mentors some direction about whom to partner with and what gaps to work on with the mentee. Current or past foster youth can provide valuable insight into strategies for mentoring for youth in care. Any partnerships that are established should have an agreement, especially in regards to what information can and should be shared about individual participants. If your organization provides clinical services, assess whether a mentoring component could enhance these services for youth in care. One program found that combining individual mentoring with group clinical programming had very positive outcomes.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Many older youth in or leaving care lack long-term, supportive relationships with adults that can help with transitions out of care. Thus, it is important for youth in care to have at least one adult supporter that is not paid for their involvement with the youth. Some positive effects of mentoring have been found:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Foster parents reported that when their foster children had mentors, the children displayed improved social skills and trust.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Mentoring can help youth in care build connections with adults to help them transition into post-secondary education and employment.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Youth in care who participated in a one-on-one mentoring program were found to have a statistically significant reduction in symptoms of mental health issues, including depression, anxiety, and trauma.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Participating in a mentoring program has been found to help youth in foster care cope with the stressors associated with the non-traditional living experience.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Youth in care who participated in a mentoring program were found to have more stable living situations; they did not change foster homes as frequently and were more likely to be reunified with their family than the control group.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• By providing access to caring and supportive partnership, youth in care can benefit from the positive outcomes of mentorship.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Four mentoring program models were found by the Alberta Centre for Child, Family, and Community Research to be most relevant for youth in care:

1. **Transitional mentoring** focuses on fostering independent living skills and goal setting/achievement for youth exiting out of care.
2. **Cultural empowerment mentoring** involves providing a role model from the same cultural group as the mentee.
3. **Business mentor model matches** professionals.

2, 11, 13
with youth in care to learn about potential careers.

4. **Mentoring young parents** has mentors who have been young parents mentor pregnant or parenting youth to gain positive parenting and independent living skills.

New programs could choose a model above to work within based on their clientele (age, stage of care involvement, and goals of the program).³

**E-mentoring** is another model that is gaining popularity for youth in care because it means mentees can access their mentors at all times and the relationship is not subject to the same disruption if the mentee moves to a new care facility/ foster home.³

adults, mentoring programs can help youth in care develop resiliency to cope with difficult situations.

- Mentees in care noted positive outcomes of mentoring included: building strong relationships with their mentors, feelings that life had improved, and gaining life skills for when leaving care.
- The goal-focused *My Life* program for youth in care that combines individual mentoring support and group mentoring program was found to increase participants’ feelings of control over their lives and improved life skills.², ⁴, ¹⁰, ¹², ¹³

However, results are conflicting about the effectiveness of mentoring for youth in care. One study found that there are no statistically significant differences in outcomes between matches where the mentor was paid and where the mentor participated voluntarily. Additionally, youth in care may be a more difficult population to serve through mentoring due to their more complex needs. Another study found that mentees with experiences of abuse were more likely to end matches early and thus receive neutral or negative effects from the mentoring.², ³

Refer to *Kinnections* for a comprehensive manual for implementing mentoring for youth in care, which includes tools, such as permission forms and mentor applications.², ⁴

Refer to *Mentoring Youth in Care* for comprehensive review of best practices for implementing a mentoring program for youth in care.³
| Mentee Referral, Selection & Training | **Mentees should be matched before major transition times** to help them build strong relationships to help them cope with the challenges associated with these changes.\(^2\)  
A comprehensive intake assessment must be done for mentees to ensure their specific experiences of abuse and neglect are addressed.\(^13\) | Mentors from one mentoring program for youth in care gave feedback that the mentoring intervention should begin as young as possible for the mentee.\(^10\) |
| Mentor Recruitment, Screening & Selection | Consider recruiting mentors for a program with youth in care from traditional mentoring programs - they already have developed mentoring skills.\(^2\)  
More rigorous screening is required for mentors volunteering with youth in care. Screening must also account for individual needs of mentees and thus mentors with past involvement in care should not necessarily be excluded. The following factors may be seen as “red flags” when screening a mentor:  
- Desire to change or “save” children  
- Very reserved  
- Very assertive/imposing  
- Minimal engagement  
- Unable or unwilling to provide long-term commitment\(^2,3,7\) | University and college mentors should be recruited with caution for youth who are highly transient and most vulnerable because they are less likely to be able to provide sufficiently long and consistent match.\(^1\) |
| Mentor Training | **Mentor training** should include:  
- How to build relationships with youth in care and their parents/ foster parents/ caregivers given their specific challenges;  
- Awareness of challenges mentors may face working with this population;  
- The importance of their volunteering with the young person and how disruptions in the | Refer to the *Trauma Informed Practice Guide* for more information about recognizing and responding to trauma-related issues: [http://bccewh.bc.ca/wp-content/uploads/2012/05/2013_TIP-Guide.pdf](http://bccewh.bc.ca/wp-content/uploads/2012/05/2013_TIP-Guide.pdf) |
relationship could affect them; and
- How to recognize and respond to trauma-related issues because many youth in care have experienced volatile life experiences.\textsuperscript{2,3}

| Matching Process | Building a strong relationship founded on trust may be easier when mentors have a similar life experience to their mentees, e.g., having been in care themselves.\textsuperscript{2,3,13}

Matches should meet regularly for a significant amount of time. It was noted that relationships that last less than 6 months with inconsistent meeting were found to have no and even negative impacts on the mentees in care.\textsuperscript{2} |

| Mentoring Relationship Development | Match activities at the beginning should focus on building the relationship.\textsuperscript{2}

Mentors can play a key role in reducing stigma for mentees who have been in care by normalizing their experiences and providing unconditional acceptance. Mentoring relationships are most effective must be reciprocal and diminish power imbalances.\textsuperscript{13}

Mentoring youth in care may require mentors to have more experience, contribute more time and act in a more professional-style role to address the barriers their mentees face. Mentor consistency is particularly important for youth in care because it is important to have someone on whom you can fully rely.\textsuperscript{13} |

|  |

|  | Mentors for youth in care provide various important supports that may be lacking from other adults in their lives:
- Emotional support – having someone to talk to during difficult times.
- Informational support – helping individual mentees understand important life stages (e.g., in regards to post-secondary education).
- Appraisal support – providing a different opinion when facing adversity.
- Instrumental support – includes financial support and role modeling for life skills (e.g., cooking).\textsuperscript{6}

Youth in care need to have a meaningful role in their mentoring relationship and thus natural mentoring (where mentees choose their mentors) may be a good fit.\textsuperscript{7}

Due to experiences with unpredictable relationships
with adults, **youth in care may have trouble trusting and forming bonds with other adults.** Additionally, foster youth were found to have a “survivalist self-reliance” meaning they did not want help or adult role models, which can make mentoring very difficult. However, these youth may also seek to build new relationships with adults.², ¹³

| Match Supervision, Support & Retention | Program staff should provide mentors with ongoing training and support, especially when the mentee is experiencing behavioural or mental health issues.², ¹¹, ¹³  
**Relationships are more likely to end early if the mentee is struggling with personal issues, so staff should monitor and support matches regularly throughout the program.** Staff should also be available to help in times of crisis.², ³ | Youth in care are often living in ever-changing circumstances (e.g., moving to new foster home), which can make stable mentoring relationships difficult.², ¹³ |
| Parent/ Caregiver/ Family Involvement | It is important to garner support from foster parents about the benefits of the program.¹¹ | Child welfare workers are highly involved in the lives of youth in care and thus are a strong part of defining roles of adult supporters of youth in care.⁷ |
| Match Closure & Re-Matching | **Ending mentor relationships for youth in care must be handled delicately** due to many of these youth having past experiences of abandonment. Staff should ensure mentors have the skills to end the relationship in a healthy way which they can model to the mentees.⁷, ⁸  
Policies about closures should be established so that mentors and mentees know how to end the relationships and reflect on their successes. Relationships should be celebrated when ending to promote positivity.² | One study found that youth were not able to make long-term commitments to a mentoring program due to busy schedules for both mentors and mentees and lack of support of foster parents.¹¹ |
| SPECIAL CONSIDERATION: Natural Mentoring | Youth must be given a say in if and how natural mentoring relationships are established in their lives. It is difficult for child welfare workers to assess the suitability of potential natural mentors, and thus a specific role should be established to support youth in care developing natural mentoring relationships.

Replicating the strengths of natural mentoring relationships may help enhance mentoring outcomes for youth in care. |

Youth in care may be less likely to have positive adult relationships due to their difficult life circumstances. Since natural mentoring relationships emerge out of existing relationships between a young person and an adult, there is more likelihood that there is a crossover of social networks and thus the likelihood of the relationship continuing long-term is higher.

Natural mentoring can help by providing youth leaving foster care with meaningful relationships with adults to support them in their development. Natural mentoring has been found to:

- Support youth through transitions.
- Reduce mental health challenges, including, lowered stress, fewer symptoms of depression, and lower likelihood of being arrested.
- Reduce suicidal thoughts, sexually transmitted infections, and decrease likelihood to have been in a fight that resulted in injury.
- Youth who had aged out of foster care who had a close relationship with an adult were more likely to have obtained employment and less likely to have recent experiences with homelessness.
- Youth who have aged out of foster care who have a natural mentor were more likely to have a bank account and high expectations for future income.

Natural mentoring is seen by child welfare professionals as important for youth in care to develop strong and supportive relationships with adults. However, implementing natural mentoring into services for youth in care may create extra work for social workers who are already have large caseloads and minimal time for each |
If youth in care do not have access to natural mentors, formal mentoring programs are a good alternative.  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>References</th>
<th>Systematic Reviews:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Literature Reviews:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Individual Studies:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Individual Studies:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Individual Studies:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Individual Studies:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Individual Studies:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Individual Studies:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8 Greeson, J. K. P., Usher, L., &amp; Grinstein-Weiss, M. (2010). One adult who is crazy about you: Can natural mentoring relationships increase assets among young adults with and without foster care experience? <em>Children and Youth</em></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


**Other Sources:**


**Existing Toolkits**


Kinnections Mentoring Program for Youth: [https://www.mcf.gov.bc.ca/foster/pdf/Kinnections_Template.pdf](https://www.mcf.gov.bc.ca/foster/pdf/Kinnections_Template.pdf)
Youth Involved with the Criminal Justice System

“He actually cared for me, even when I was away [incarcerated] he was the only one that visited me” (Youth Arts Action Group Youth Consultation)

Key Lessons

• Program development for mentoring youth in conflict with the law should involve:
  o Partnering with criminal justice and diversion programs to recruit mentees and support them;
  o Having practices in place to ensure voluntary participation of mentees;
  o Focussing on emotional support to enhance outcomes; and
  o Creating policies and procedures to manage match interruptions and closures that may result from changes in custody / re-arrest / re-incarceration.

• Mentee training should be provided to help participants build connections with their mentors, understand the program guidelines, and the roles and limitations of the mentors.

• Mentors will require specific training as well to help them understand the criminal justice system, handle difficult behaviours, build awareness of services in the community, deal with different challenges the mentees may face (including learning disabilities, mental health issues, etc.).

Existing Toolkits & Resources
The Mentoring Toolkit: Resources for Developing Programs for Incarcerated Youth:
## Effective Mentoring for Youth Involved in the Criminal Justice System

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Standards &amp; Good Practices (linked to positive outcomes for participants)</th>
<th>Other Pertinent Info (from other studies &amp; reports)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Program Planning                | **When planning a mentoring program for youth in conflict with the law, community partnerships should be developed to help create responsive programming and to recruit participants. One suggestion is to establish a committee including community partners and parents.**<sup>9, 16</sup>  

**Partnering with community diversion programs, probation officers, and youth court judges** can help to recruit mentees with criminal justice involvement and **support them throughout the mentoring process.**

Mentoring programs that are embedded into other interventions or partnered with youth courts are recommended because this model streamlines the mentee referral process and the program has an easier time maintaining connection with the youth.<sup>6, 14, 15, 16</sup> | **A meta-analysis examining effects of mentoring programs for youth with complex needs, found mentoring had a statistically significant reduction in delinquency and associated behaviours: aggression, drug use, and academic performance.**<sup>3</sup>  

Mentoring can help youth in court-ordered programs comply with program activities.<sup>13</sup>  

Garringer and colleagues caution against using group mentoring for youth that have engaged in “aggressive, delinquent, sexually risky, or substance abuse behaviours” because the group format may lead to reinforcing negative behaviours (p. 18). Similarly, individualized mentoring was found to result in longer matches, although this approach was not significantly |
If working with other agencies, there should be a Memorandum of Understanding completed before the program begins to outline roles and expectations; for how to write MOUs, see Referring youth in juvenile justice settings to mentoring programs.\textsuperscript{14}

Programs that operate in a secure facility must be designed in accordance with the facility rules and regulations and also consider safety concerns; mentoring staff should be trained on strategies and protocols for working with youth in the facility by staff at the facility.\textsuperscript{14,16}

When emotional support was central to the mentoring program design and mentors participated for professional development, there were enhanced outcomes for youth in conflict with the law.\textsuperscript{1,3}

Mentoring programs should have at least one full-time staff member who can follow-up regularly with participants.\textsuperscript{16}

Programs should evaluate not only mentee recidivism rates, but also other changes in the mentee, such as:
- Satisfaction of mentors and mentees
- Academic and behavioural successes
- Mentor and mentee retention
- Quantity and quality of mentoring sessions\textsuperscript{16}

**Program Implementation**

Some **key tips for implementing mentoring** for youth in conflict with the law are:
- Program coordinators should have contact with the youth participants' Probation Officers in order correlated with fulfilling all match commitments.\textsuperscript{15,17}

Natural mentoring may be more successful in supporting transition out of custody and reducing recidivism than other mentoring models.\textsuperscript{6}

Mentoring is **more successful** for youth involved with the criminal justice system when **combined with other interventions**.\textsuperscript{15}

For mentoring program development resources see *The mentoring toolkit: Resources for developing programs for incarcerated youth.*\textsuperscript{16}

Many positive outcomes of mentoring for youth in conflict with the law have been found:
- Mentoring has been found to have many of the same positive outcomes as group counselling,
to provide updates and collaborate to **help the youth avoid “falling through the cracks”**.

- Providing meaningful activities, that engage mentees in their community and provide opportunities to bond with their mentors and peers.
- Match meetings should take place in public spaces in order to help the mentors feel at ease when working with youth who have had contact with the criminal justice system.
- Individual support is important for the mentees and thus **one-on-one components** should be include in any program design.
- There are **key skills for mentees** who have been involved with the criminal justice system: **life skills (e.g., finding employment or housing), critical thinking, and communication and healthy relationships.**
- The more meetings that a pair has the greater likelihood that the mentee will achieve their goals.
- When done safely, social media can be used to keep in touch with youth as much as possible.\(^9,11,14,15,17\)

Male mentors are harder to recruit and therefore if same-gender matching is the goal of the program, small group mentoring can be employed as an interim solution to finding an appropriate mentor for a male-identified mentee.\(^14\)

including social, educational, and employment skills.

- Mentoring has been shown to reduce recidivism rates by over 20%.
- One-on-one mentoring incorporated into release programs for youth exiting custody can have a significant return on investment: “for a one-time investment of $500,000 to fund the program, the state may realize a savings of over $3.2 million” due to the large decrease in re-incarceration of participants (p. 11).
- Inter-agency coordinated programs are most likely to provide a return on investment for youth in conflict with the law.
- Mentoring is often used to support youth post-custody to assist with re-engaging in the community and monitoring progress; these interventions help ensure a positive transition back to the community, which reduces the likelihood that the young person will return to custody.\(^1,4,9,13,14,17\)

However, the findings on the impact of mentoring on youth recidivism rates are complex. When following up with youth who had received mentoring after 12 months, there was a larger reduction in recidivism than for those who did not receive mentoring. Longer-term follow-ups yielded less promising results; reductions in recidivism were not much different than for those who did not receive mentoring. Mentoring for youth in conflict with the law may also be less effective with “chronic offenders”.\(^1,6,15\)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mentee Referral, Selection &amp; Training</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Probation officers can make mentoring a court ordered program, which would reduce the challenges associated with having parental support of the program. Additionally, referral of youth who are currently in secure custody to mentoring programs can be done through youth’s treatment team or by self-referral.  

When selecting mentees, the length of custody/detention and probation should be considered because if the relationship will be cut short, there could be greater harm done to the young person. Ideally, mentoring relationships should last at least one year. Youth should also not be excluded based on involvement with certain illegal activities.  

It is important to **have measures in place to ensure youth** in conflict with the law are **voluntarily participating in the mentoring program**.  

Program staff should screen mentees for mental health issues and assess the home life of the young person prior to involvement with the criminal justice system so the mentoring intervention can be designed to best support the unique assets and challenges of each mentee.  

Youth in conflict with the law may have difficulty being emotionally available, which can limit their ability to connect with their mentor. **Mentee training should take place to help individuals understand the parameters of the program and consequently also reduce mentee attrition.** Mentee training should include:  

- Understanding mentoring and the roles of individuals involved; |
- Clarifying expectations and responsibilities for the relationships;
- Explaining boundaries of the relationships (including limits to confidentiality);
- Learning how to recognize and respond to inappropriate mentor actions;
- Learning how to connect with program staff and request support; and
- Developing and practicing skills for building healthy relationships.\textsuperscript{16}

| Mentor Recruitment, Screening & Selection | Mentors should always be required to complete a background check.\textsuperscript{14} | University and college mentors should be recruited with caution for youth who are highly transient and most vulnerable because they are less likely to be able to provide a sufficiently long and consistent match.\textsuperscript{2} |

| Mentor Training | **Mentor training** should include:  
- **Understanding the youth criminal justice system**;  
- Working with the **unique needs of youth who have been in conflict with the law**;  
- **How to handle difficult behaviours** of the mentees, such as testing boundaries, disrespect, and lack of cooperation;  
- Learning about **services available in the community** to refer their mentee when a specific issue arises; and  
- Understanding of **learning disabilities, mental health issues, cultural issues and strategies to support youth dealing with these issues**. These skills can largely reduce mentor attrition.\textsuperscript{9,16,17} | Mentor training should take place on an ongoing basis and at least once a month.\textsuperscript{16} |
| Matching Process | For **matching**, there should be **consideration to the following factors**:  
  • The matching process should be well thought out. One suggestion is to **begin with small group activities**, so mentors and mentees can get to know one another and then identify natural mentoring pairs from there.  
  • Young women who have been in conflict with the law are more likely to have had experiences of sexual violence and thus **same gender matching is important**.  
  • **Matching mentees with mentors of the same cultural background and gender was found to have greater positive effects** than cross-cultural and cross-gender matching.  
  • **Priority should be given to mentee interests** and in what characteristics they would like in a mentor.  

Youth are more likely to be matched successfully if they are placed in the program with the shortest waiting list.  

Mentoring relationships should begin while the mentees are still in custody in order to ensure longevity after release and best support the youth as they return to the community.  

| Mentoring Relationship Development | At the beginning of the mentoring relationship activities should be structured by the program to help the match build a connection.  

Mentors and mentees should set goals early on in the relationship, especially if the mentee will be exiting.  

Youth may not be matched because they have engaged in very serious behaviours that programs have prohibited, an appropriate mentor cannot be found due to small numbers of mentors, and lack of family support.
custody soon. The Washington Juvenile Rehabilitation Administration (JRA) program advocates that once mentees set their goals, mentors should set goals as well so the pair can work on their goals together and hold one another accountable.\(^{16}\)

**Regular contact with mentees is important** as youth in conflict with the law are often transient and difficult to connect with regularly.\(^{14}\)

| Match Supervision, Support & Retention | Expectations of mentors and mentees about the type of relationship desired should be established prior to matching to avoid setting the pair up for failure.\(^{15}\) Staff should keep in regular contact with mentees, their family members, and mentors to assess progress and support the mentors in responding to any issues or conflicts. If youth will be released from custody, programs should be in touch with mentees 24 hours after to provide support.\(^{14,16}\) | **Maintaining a mentoring relationship once a young person has been released from detention/custody can be difficult** as some facilities are not in the young person’s community.\(^{14}\) |
| Parent/ Caregiver/ Family Involvement | Program coordinators should connect with parents and caregivers regularly to address issues.\(^{12}\) Mentors should also actively build relationships with family members and friends to help ensure the mentee has support for being involved in the program.\(^{15}\) |  |
| Match Closure & Re-Matching | There should be **policies and procedures established to deal with match interruption or unexpected closures due to mentee re-arrest/re-incarceration.**\(^{14}\) |  |
| SPECIAL CONSIDERATION: | Considerations when planning mentoring, should include: | Children of incarcerated parents have been found to have certain negative outcomes, including being seven... |
**Children of Prisoners**

- Engaging parents, including the parent in prison, from the initial stages and provide ongoing communication about the child’s progress.
- Altering the screening process to ensure mentors have the unique skills needed to support the mentee.
- Determining the age of the mentee when their parent was imprisoned in order to assess any developmental issues.
- How to end the relationships because mentees may be particularly vulnerable to losing an adult role model.⁵,⁷

Mentee training for children of prisoners should include:
- How to communicate thoughts and feelings;
- Ideas for how to build a relationship with the mentor;
- Establish guidelines about acceptable behaviour; and
  - How to ask the mentor for help when needed.⁵

Mentor training for working with children of prisoners should include:
- Defining expectations for the match early on about length of the mentoring relationship, meeting activities/ frequency, and possible outcomes;
- Understanding that the children may have difficulty trusting others, which can make building the relationship more difficult;
- Information about the unique strengths and needs of children of prisoners;
- Explain the context in which the children live and how the parent incarceration can lead to stigma and shame and their impacts on the development times more likely to be involved with the criminal justice system and increased likelihood of attachment issues.⁵,¹⁶

Overall, the results of mentoring for children of incarcerated parents are not clear. Research shows that mentoring relationships for children of prisoners that last longer than a year are very positive: 93% had increased confidence, about 60% had increased “sense of future”, and over half had better academic outcomes and improved behaviour at school. Relationships that lasted less than 6 months were found to have no significant effect.⁵,⁷
of the child;
• Strategies to building healthy relationships;
• Communication styles, including how to approach a mentee’s request to visit their parent in prison;
• How to support the child in responding to stress related to having a parent in prison, and coping with the situation parent leaves prison;
• Exploring personal values and beliefs; and
• Establishing boundaries with the child and their family.2, 5, 7

How mentors can foster a positive relationship with their mentees:
• “Be consistent, patient, and flexible”
• Be realistic about possible outcomes
• Have high expectations of the mentee and support them in meeting those expectations. Hold them accountable when they do not meet the expectations
• Utilize program staff as a resource when experiencing challenges
• “Honour their commitment to the child and the relationship” (p. 24)5

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>References</th>
<th>Systematic Reviews:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Literature Reviews:


Individual Studies:


Other Sources:


Homeless Youth

“I don’t have a mentor who feels bad toward what’s going on in my life right now. All I want is a mentor that doesn’t judge at all. Let’s say I stay in a shelter and stuff. I don’t want him to feel bad for me cause I’m staying there. I just want him to like connect with and to have a good time with, to talk to and stuff when I’m confused.” (Covenant House Youth Consultation)

Key Lessons
- There is less information available on effective mentoring for homeless youth. This is a gap in our current understanding of mentoring youth facing barriers to success.
- Long-term mentoring relationships may be difficult for homeless youth due to transient life experiences (Karabanow & Clement, 2004).
- Flexibility is key when mentoring street involved youth as challenges and crises may emerge at various times (Greenlee, et al., 2013).
- Programs should establish end dates at the beginning of the program to help youth understand the parameters of the program and reduce feelings of abandonment that may emerge when the match closes (Cullen, 2006).
- Natural mentoring may be a promising strategy for mentoring homeless youth as it can be more adaptable and result in similarly positive outcomes (Greenlee, et al., 2013).

Existing Toolkits & Resources
Mentoring and befriending for young homeless people: A good practice guide:
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Standards &amp; Good Practices (linked to positive outcomes for participants)</th>
<th>Other Pertinent Info (including trends &amp; stats)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Program Planning</td>
<td>Working with community partners (including homeless youth) to plan and set objectives for a mentoring program with homeless youth can enhance outcomes.(^4,5,) (^7) Confidentiality and privacy policies should be established and shared with mentors and mentees before beginning the mentoring relationships.(^4,8)</td>
<td>Specific needs and vulnerabilities of homeless youth should be considered when planning and implementing mentoring programs.(^4) <strong>Homeless youth may be less likely to have natural mentors</strong> due to the conflicts that lead to leaving home. Since natural mentoring can have many positive outcomes, <strong>natural mentoring is a promising model for homeless youth</strong>. Additionally, natural mentoring may be more appropriate for this population as it does not have formal meetings times and occurs more fluidly.(^3)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Program Implementation | **Adaptability in program implementation is key** for responding to challenges and crises that emerge.\(^4\) It can be helpful to consistently use informal feedback from mentees to assess and update the program.\(^4\) | Homeless children are more likely to:  
  • Move frequently  
  • Experience school disruption  
  • Witness violence in the home  
  • Struggle with mental health issues (e.g., depression and anxiety)  
  • Be separated from family members  
  • Have physical health problems  **Mentoring can support children with these issues by providing consistent and caring role modeling during transient and stressful life circumstances.\(^2,5\)** |
Results from mentoring interventions are conflicting:
- One program found that homeless youth in their mentoring program felt they had developed a significant relationship through the program.
- Another study found homeless mentees had decreased feelings of loneliness and stress and increased sense of equality, self esteem, and enhanced coping skills.
- Natural mentoring was found to have significant effects on reducing risky sexual behaviours, but not in other areas of physical and mental health.\(^2, 3, 4, 6\)

Perhaps mixed results are related to the fact that mentoring is most effective when it occurs for a year or more and street-involved youth are more transient and may not be able to sustain mentoring long-term.\(^1\)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mentor Training</th>
<th>Helping mentors understand power and privilege and learn how to treat their mentees as equals is important for reducing power imbalances. Conversely, some people found that power imbalances (where a mentor had control in certain situations and could use that to support the mentee) can help mentees feel safe and protected.(^4)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Matching Process</td>
<td>One program allowed mentees to select their mentors after participating in a Meet and Greet session to ensure the match would be appropriate for that young person.(^9)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Mentoring Relationship Development | One program required mentors to contact their mentees once a week and meet in-person twice per month to ensure consistency and limit early termination.\(^8\)
Emphasizing self-determination and personal goal |
|                 | One program found success by providing stipends for homeless youth participants as this supported their basic needs (food, shelter, clothing) as outlined by Maslow’s Hierarchy of Needs.\(^4\) |
setting is important for reducing power imbalances that exist between adults and youth, especially those that are marginalized.  

Mentors should inquire about the needs of mentees ongoing and alter interventions to support them as best as possible.  

| Match Supervision, Support & Retention | Program staff should connect with mentors and mentees regularly to monitor progress and support in times of challenges. 

| Match Closure & Re-Matching | **To ensure mentees do not feel abandoned**, a concern that may be more relevant for homeless youth, there should be end dates for the mentoring established at the beginning of the program. 

At Covenant House, if a mentor resigns from the program they must inform the program staff and their mentee of the decision. They will also engage in an exit interview with the mentor. 

| Celebration & Recognition | Covenant House recognizes mentor service annually and provides thank you cards to the mentors. 

| References: | **Literature Reviews:** 


**Individual Studies:** 


Other Sources:


Girls

Key Lessons

• Gender-specific mentor programming should include creating a space that is safe for the needs of youth. Additionally, although young women may prefer relationship-building activities, individual preferences for types of relationships should ultimately define the program direction and activities (Liang, Bogat, & Duffy, 2013; Canadian Women’s Foundation, 2014).

• Mentor training should focus on how gender may impact relationships and specific skills for facilitating mentoring from a gendered lens. (Liang, Bogat, & Duffy, 2013; Canadian Women’s Foundation, 2014).

“I think I would want [a mentor of] the same gender because I feel like [she would be] more relatable and they could help you with your issues. And especially some things you wouldn’t really want to go to a guy about. Like if you’re having like relationship issues or like female issues.” (YWCA Youth Consultation)

Existing Toolkits & Resources

Girls Mentoring Toolkit:
http://mentoringgirls.ca
# Effective Mentoring for Girls

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Standards &amp; Good Practices</th>
<th>Other Pertinent Info</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Program Planning</td>
<td>Choose a set of specific individual and community outcomes that you would like to achieve through your girls programs.(^4)</td>
<td>Refer to Girls Group Mentoring Toolkit to find information about approaches and activities for mentoring programs for girls with special considerations (e.g., girls in rural and remote communities).(^4)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Program Implementation       | **Considering the space and specific considerations of the girls in your program** is important to ensure you are fostering a safe space. Consider these factors:  
  
  - Staff and volunteers are female-identified  
  - Space is physically secure  
  - Girls feel they can share in a respectful and confidential way  
  - Girls can discuss experiences and challenges that are particular to their gender identification  
  - Boundaries are established with participants  
  - Addressing oppressive language and comments  
  - There are considerations for gender equity- e.g., posters representing women  
  - Activities are inclusive for people from all different experiences  
  - Mentoring relationships should take place for at least a year to allow sufficient time for relationship development  
  - Flexibility in program activities can allow for a more girl-centred approach as the girl mentees will have more time to take leadership in determining activities | Gender-specific mentoring programs can positively influence girls by helping them build skills which encourage them to:  
  
  - Feel more confident  
  - Advocate for themselves  
  - Build healthy relationships  
  - Feel connected to their peers\(^4\)  
  
  Girls group mentoring was found to be more effective when there were smaller groups and thus more time for personal attention.\(^4\)  
  
  Boys are more likely to see their mentoring relationships as significant than girls. This may be due to the fact that girls may already have lots of social support in their lives.\(^1\) |
• Programs should be aware of the impact of gender on matching and support mentors in managing challenges related to gender in their match.\(^3,4\)

Employ best practices in the program approach:
• “Pay explicit attention to gender equity
• Be asset-based with a positive focus
• Be participant-directed and/or participant-involved
• Be interactive and fun
• Provide a safe, friendly space for girls
• Be accessible and address any possible barriers to participation
• Respect and celebrate the diversity of girls, including all who identify as female” (p. 97)\(^4\)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mentee Referral, Selection &amp; Training</th>
<th>Recruit girls who will most benefit from the mentoring experience.(^4) Ensure promotional material for mentee recruitment uses age appropriate language and graphics that reflect girls of all different shapes and sizes.(^4)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mentor Recruitment, Screening &amp; Selection</td>
<td>Consider the needs of the girls you will be working with and the mentor competencies that will support them.(^4)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Mentor Training | Mentor training should:
  • Explore how gender may impact the relationship and how gender differences/similarities do not necessarily dictate differences similarities in interests;
  • Discuss skills for facilitating groups with girls, so mentors feel prepared to begin mentoring after training is completed; and
  • Provide knowledge about how to create a safe |
<p>| | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Matching Process</strong></td>
<td>Same-gender matching may be helpful for gender socialization and role modeling by adult who is not a parent; this consideration may be particularly salient for boys raised by single mothers. Similarly, mentors who share life experiences with their mentees may be seen as more credible and thus developing relationships with their mentees may be easier.</td>
<td>There is limited research about whether matches are more effective if they are cross- or same-gender. However, cross-gender matching can reduce the amount of time a young person spends on a waiting list, resulting in getting a mentor more quickly.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Mentoring Relationship Development</strong></td>
<td>The research indicates that in general girls may prefer relationship building as opposed to boys who may prefer activity-based mentoring, although ultimately individual needs and interests should be prioritized.</td>
<td>Liang, Bogat, and Duffy noted that while boys may develop mentoring relationships more quickly, girls may benefit more from long-term mentoring (p. 167). Some programs that target girls may be end up assuming what girls want and need from mentoring which can make the intervention much less successful.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| **Parent/ Caregiver/ Family Involvement** | It is recommended to engage parents, so that the outcomes are more positive. However, there are some important considerations:  
- The mentee’s thoughts about involving their parent/guardian in program activities.  
- Parents/guardian desires more engagement with the program.  
- Safety issues are present and parent involvement could enhance safety.  
- What is the best form of parent engagement. | Consider inviting important people in the lives of the girls to parent engagement events as some parents may not be able to participate and this can prevent girls from feeling excluded. |
### References


Literature Reviews:


Other Sources:


### Existing Toolkits

Girls Mentoring Toolkit:  
[http://mentoringgirls.ca](http://mentoringgirls.ca)
Just like there are evidence-informed practices in program implementation, there are also a number of best practices in program management. The *Elements of Effective Practice for Mentoring™* (MENTOR, 2015) identifies these key areas:

- clarity of purpose and intended impact
- leadership and professional development
- clear policies and procedures to maximize quality
- resource development
- communications and marketing
- evaluation and learning

Some helpful tools and templates in these areas can be found here:

Tools for designing and planning a program (MENTOR, 2015)
Includes policies and procedures.

Tools to manage a program for success (MENTOR, 2015)
Includes resource development, communication and marketing, and information management.

Tools for effective program activities and operations (MENTOR, 2015)
Includes orientation guides, match agreements, match activities, screening guidelines, closure forms, etc.

In addition to maximizing the quality and the impact of your program in the present, these components are also considered key strategies to support the sustainability of your program in the future.
Sustainability Planning

‘Sustainability’ can be defined as: “the overall stability of a [program]: its ability to weather temporary challenges, provide quality services in the present, and maintain a solid foundation for its future” (MacRae & Wakeland, 2006, p.1).

In the context of short-term, project-based funding, it can be very difficult to sustain a program beyond original or seed funding. Planning for the future and longevity of an initiative is an ongoing process that must begin early. A review of sustainability planning for mentoring programs identified six (6) key strategies to keep in mind when striving for sustainability. These key strategies are shown in the graph below:

Six Key Strategies of Sustainability Planning

For more detailed information and practical tools related to these six key strategies, refer to this Sustainability Planning Handbook. There is also an interactive workshop that accompanies this Handbook. For more information, contact us.
## Key Resources on Program Management & Sustainability Planning

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Key Resources for Program Management &amp; Sustainability Planning</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Striving for Sustainability: Six Key Strategies to Guide Your Efforts (Bania, 2014):</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><a href="http://www.melaniebania.ca">www.melaniebania.ca</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Elements of Effective Practice for Mentoring™: Elements of Program Planning &amp; Management (MENTOR, 2015, pp. 76-85):</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Evaluation, which is also referred to as Performance Measurement, can be broadly defined as:

... a process of systematic inquiry to provide information for decision-making about the quality and/or value of some object – a program, project, process, organization, system, or product. Use of the evaluation results might lead to making refinements to the program or to offering new services or products” (Preskill & Torres, 1999, p. 12).

Note that regardless of the type of evaluation undertaken, all evaluations involve a cycle as described in this graph:
There are many different types of evaluation. This toolkit provides information on output monitoring, process evaluation, and outcome evaluation. By exploring the following subsections, you will learn strategies for developing your own evaluation for mentoring programs for youth facing multiple barriers to success.

- Developing a Program Logic Model or Theory of Change
- Types of Evaluations
- Collecting Data: Methods & Tools
- Analyzing, Reporting, & Using Results: Collaborative Learning & Dissemination
- Ethical standards & Considerations
- Now What? Building Capacity for Evaluation

Developing a Program Logic Model or Theory of Change

A Logic Model outlines various program components, including inputs, activities, outputs and outcomes, usually in a table format. It starts with the program and charts its components in a linear or hierarchical fashion, without showing why activities are expected to produce those outcomes.

For example, the logic model below (Alberta Mentoring Partnership, n.d.) shows that the program is working on addressing a lack of after school programming and concerns around academic underachievement, lack of positive role models, etc. (needs). It also shows what is being put into the program in terms of funding, personnel, materials and space (inputs). It lists the activities that will take place as part of the program, and the immediate outputs it will be able to demonstrate (occurrence of activities and satisfaction with activities). Finally, it lists the outcomes and impact it hopes to achieve in the short-term, medium-term, and longer-term.
# Sample Mentoring Program Logic Model

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Needs</th>
<th>Inputs</th>
<th>Activities</th>
<th>Outputs</th>
<th>Outcomes</th>
<th>Impact</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Youth at-risk of exclusion, failure to complete high school, and criminal behaviour</td>
<td>Funding: • Provincial grant • Casino funds • Corporate partner Personnel: • 1 FTE coordinator • 10 volunteer mentors • Services of partner agencies (in-kind) Materials: • Training manual • Supplies (cracks, games, handouts, etc.) Facilities: • Space at youth center • Community swimming pool</td>
<td>Supports: • Recruitment/screening of mentors and mentees • Staff training and supervision • Mentor training • Mentee training • Bi-monthly supervision of matches • Parent/teacher check-ins Programming: • Group activities (cultural awareness, health, self-esteem) • Goal setting • Activity planning and structure successes between matched • One-to-one interaction between matches • Family nights • Guest presenters • Closing ceremony</td>
<td>• Implementation of staff training sessions • Implementation of mentor training sessions • Mentors/mentees are satisfied with activities • Mentor/mentee/parent are satisfied with mentoring relationship</td>
<td>Initial • Youth is supported by a positive non-parental adult • Youth has increased knowledge of culture Medium Term • Youth is making healthy choices • Youth is building social skills</td>
<td>Long Term • Participating youth succeed at school and have positive peers, family and community relationships</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Please note this is an example. Mentoring programs will need to articulate the specific outcomes they are seeking to achieve and design the program accordingly.*
A *Theory of Change* is a visual depiction of the link between your activities and outcomes, including how and why the desired change is expected to come about (i.e., a causal model that includes assumptions and justifications). It typically starts with the end goal of an initiative in mind (the desired impact), then works its way backwards to decide on the program approaches that will most likely result in that impact.

For example, the Theory of Change below shows that the program seeks to support youth in continuously developing and integrating new skills in order to fulfill their potential. It tells us that the first step of the program is to identify sparks, then promote a growth mindset, identify indicators of thriving, and build goal management skills. It tells us that adult guides must support youth in specific ways in order for them to be on a road to a hopeful future. A theory of change is more focused on how a program intends to produce desired outcomes.

(Camp Fire, 2014)
Both the Logic Model and the Theory of Change have their uses. The Logic Model can be sufficient when outlining a fairly simple project. The Theory of Change is increasingly being encouraged when designing a more complex and comprehensive initiative, so you can articulate and track the change you hope to create.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Logic Model</th>
<th>Theory of Change</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **What it is**       | - Linear word representation  
                      - List of components  
                      - Descriptive  
                      - Program / Staff / Funder Driven  
                      | - Visual graphic representation  
                      - Critical thinking of complex work  
                      - Pathway of change  
                      - Explanatory  
                      - Includes consultation with diverse stakeholders  |
| **Pros**             | Useful when you want to:  
                      - Show someone something they can understand at a glance  
                      - Demonstrate you have identified the basic inputs, outputs and outcomes for your work  
                      - Summarize a complex theory into basic categories  
                      | Useful when you want to:  
                      - Design a complex initiative and have a rigorous plan for success (with indicators)  
                      - Evaluate appropriate outcomes at the right time and the right sequence  
                      - Explain why an initiative worked or did not work, and what exactly went right or wrong  |
| **Cons**             | - Typically does not include indicators  
                      - Too simplistic to be helpful in explaining dynamics during a process and outcome evaluation  
                      | - Can be a lot of work  
                      - Takes time to develop  |

**Types of Evaluation**

There are many different kinds of evaluation. Below we briefly explain performance monitoring, process evaluation, and outcome evaluation. A program evaluation must be tailored to the specific program in question - it can therefore be difficult to find resources that are relevant to all.

**Monitoring outputs and activities** involves collecting and counting service level records and data to determine:
- Who you serve (socio-demographic indicators);
- How many you serve; and
• Through how many activities of different types.

It allows you to capture and communicate basic numbers on what your program looks like in terms of the number of participants you reached, the number of activities you conducted, attendance levels, retention levels, etc. It also involves representing your inputs in a numerical way (i.e., number of staff, grant moneys, etc) (Wholey, Hatry, & Newcomer, 2010).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Purpose</th>
<th>Questions</th>
<th>Indicators</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Inputs</td>
<td></td>
<td>• costs and in-kind contributions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Activities</td>
<td></td>
<td>• # mentee / mentor applications</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outputs</td>
<td></td>
<td>• # participants accepted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• # of participants by gender identity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• # of participants by age</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• # participants trained</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• # matches</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• # and type of activities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• attendance / retention</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• duration of matches</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• # match completions (rate)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A process evaluation examines and reports on the overall implementation of the program (policies, procedures, strategies) and the extent to which the program was delivered as intended to the target population. A typical program evaluation would assess quantitative (numbered) and qualitative (narrative) data related to:

• Program awareness, demand and capacity;
• Program participants;
• Program management;
• Program activities and implementation;
• Community partnerships;
For mentoring programs in particular, an important part of a process evaluation involves assessing the quality of the mentoring relationships between program participants (MENTOR, 2015).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Purpose</th>
<th>Questions</th>
<th>Indicators</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Assessing:</td>
<td>Did we do what we said we would do? Did we serve who we intended to serve? Did we use the strategies we intended to use? Why / why not? How did processes evolve over time? Did participants receive the proper amount, type and quality of service as we intended? Were they (and others) satisfied with the service they received? To what extent do our mentoring relationships meet the critical benchmarks of quality mentoring relationships? Was the program well coordinated? Were program staff able to work effectively with partner organizations? What is working well, what is not working well, what should be improved? What lessons did we learn about our participants and program?</td>
<td>• fidelity to policies and procedures • staff perspectives • mentee’s view of the relationship • mentor’s view of the relationship • participant satisfaction with the program • parent satisfaction • partner satisfaction • evaluator observation • successes • challenges • lessons learned • needed improvements</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
An **outcome evaluation** examines the extent to which your efforts had the impact you intended or expected them to have. Typical outcome measures reflect changes in level of knowledge, values/attitudes/beliefs, skills, behaviours, and conditions (i.e., health conditions, employment, system involvement) (Wholey, Hatry, & Newcomer, 2010). In order to assess change, data collection tools must be administered at intake to determine a baseline (pre-intervention), and then again after certain periods of time during and/or after the intervention (i.e., follow-up at 6 months, 1 year, etc.).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Purpose</th>
<th>Questions</th>
<th>Indicators</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Examining: | To what extent did our efforts change participants’ knowledge / attitudes / skills / behaviours / conditions? Have participants and others benefitted from their experience in the program? How? | Increased:  
- knowledge  
- positive values/attitudes/beliefs  
- social & emotional wellbeing  
- skills for...  
- school engagement  
- employment participation  
- community engagement  
- housing stability  

Decreased system involvement:  
- child protection  
- justice system  
- etc. |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Key Frameworks / Resources for Identifying Outcomes and Indicators&lt;sup&gt;1&lt;/sup&gt;</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Core Character Competencies and Positive Youth Development (Resiliency Initiatives, 2012):</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40 Developmental Assets for Adolescents:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><a href="http://www.search-institute.org/content/40-developmental-assets-adolescents-ages-12-18">http://www.search-institute.org/content/40-developmental-assets-adolescents-ages-12-18</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stepping Up: A Strategic Framework to Help Ontario’s Youth Succeed (Ministry of Children and Youth Services, 2013):</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><a href="http://www.children.gov.on.ca/htdocs/English/topics/youthopportunities/steppingup/contents.aspx">http://www.children.gov.on.ca/htdocs/English/topics/youthopportunities/steppingup/contents.aspx</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Youth Measures Database:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><a href="http://www.excellenceforchildandyouth.ca/support-tools/measures-database">http://www.excellenceforchildandyouth.ca/support-tools/measures-database</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PerformWell Database of Outcomes and Tools:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><a href="http://www.performwell.org">www.performwell.org</a></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<sup>1</sup> Also consult the youth assessment tools identified on p. 33
Collecting Data: Methods & Tools

There are various typical (traditional) methods of data collection that can be used including: surveys, one-on-one interviews, focus groups, observation, participant logs, and program records.

There are other data collection methods that are participatory, arts-based and collaborative in nature, sometimes based in Indigenous research methodology (Kovach, 2005; Lavallee, 2009; McNiff, 1998; Tolman & Brydon-Miller, 2001; ). These are considered youth friendly as they incorporate experiential learning where the participant is fully engaged in the process (Park, 1993). Examples of these data collection methods include:

- **Body mapping:** a series of drawing and painting exercises are used to create life-size body images or 'body maps' to help participants to tell their stories and visually represent the impact of their circumstances on their health and wellbeing (Gastaldo, Magalhaes, Carrasco, & Davy, 2012).

- **Sharing Circles:** a sharing and gathering of information, emotions, and stories about people's experiences that is based in a series of group rituals. The facilitator is viewed as an equal participant in this process, and is given permission to report on the discussions (Lavallee, 2009).

- **Symbol-based reflection:** participants share paintings, drawings, sculptures, crafts, songs, or stories as representative symbols of their experience (Lavallee, 2009).

- **PhotoVoice:** participants take and share photos that help them tell their story about their experiences. The photos are tied together through a narrative description of what they mean to the person (Wang & Feng, 1996).

### Data Collection Methods

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Method</th>
<th>Use when</th>
<th>Advantages</th>
<th>Disadvantages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Document Review | Program documents or literature are available and can provide insight into the program or the evaluation | - Data already exist  
- Does not interrupt the program  
- Little or no burden on others  
- Can provide historical or comparison data  
- Introduces little bias | - Time consuming  
- Data limited to what exists and is available  
- Data may be incomplete  
- Requires clearly defining the data you’re seeking |
| Observation | You want to learn how the program actually operates—its processes and activities | - Allows you to learn about the program as it is occurring  
- Can reveal unanticipated information of value  
- Flexible in the course of collecting data | - Time consuming  
- Having an observer can alter events  
- Difficult to observe multiple processes simultaneously  
- Can be difficult to interpret observed behaviors |
| Survey | You want information directly from a defined group of people to get a general idea of a situation, to generalize about a population, or to get a total count of a particular characteristic | - Many standardized instruments available  
- Can be anonymous  
- Allows a large sample  
- Standardized responses easy to analyze  
- Able to obtain a large amount of data quickly  
- Relatively low cost  
- Convenient for respondents | - Sample may not be representative  
- May have low return rate  
- Words can bias responses  
- Closed-ended or brief responses may not provide the "whole story"  
- Not suited for all people—e.g., those with low reading level |
| Interview | You want to understand impressions and experiences in more detail and be able to expand or clarify responses | - Often better response rate than surveys  
- Allows flexibility in questions/ probes  
- Allows more in-depth information to be gathered | - Time consuming  
- Requires skilled interviewer  
- Less anonymity for respondent  
- Qualitative data more difficult to analyze |
| Focus Group | You want to collect in-depth information from a group of people about their experiences and perceptions related to a specific issue. | - Collect multiple peoples' input in one session  
- Allows in-depth discussion  
- Group interaction can produce greater insight  
- Can be conducted in short time frame  
- Can be relatively inexpensive compared to interviews | - Requires skilled facilitator  
- Limited number of questions can be asked  
- Group setting may inhibit or influence opinions  
- Data can be difficult to analyze  
- Not appropriate for all topics or populations |
Given its direct link to positive outcomes for mentees, one key dimension **any mentoring program should evaluate is the quality of the mentoring relationship between the mentee and mentor**. There are a number of existing tools to help service providers monitor and assess the quality of the mentoring relationship.

### Key Resources for Assessing the Quality of the Mentoring Relationship

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Resource</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Assessing the Quality of the Mentoring Relationship (at 6 months and at end): <a href="http://www.mentoring.org/downloads/mentoring_623.doc">www.mentoring.org/downloads/mentoring_623.doc</a></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Youth Survey: Measuring the Quality of Mentor-Youth Relationships: This questionnaire assesses youths' satisfaction with their mentoring relationships along three dimensions: youth-contentedness, emotional engagement, and dissatisfaction. <a href="http://educationnorthwest.org/sites/default/files/packeight.pdf">http://educationnorthwest.org/sites/default/files/packeight.pdf</a></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Analyzing, Sharing & Using Results

Once data is collected, it must be analyzed, interpreted, and digested for its meaning. Next steps involve (Bania, 2015):

1. Drawing evaluative conclusions that describe and assess the quality and value of your program and its components.
2. Debriefing and discussing your draft interpretations and patterns with key stakeholders to get their input into the context of the findings and any ‘reality checks’ on the data.
3. Provide insights into possibilities, options and improvements moving forward (for both program and evaluation). Programs need a formal plan that articulates when and how data is shared with various stakeholder groups, as well as how that information is used to improve the program and more effectively meet client expectations and needs.
4. Involve diverse stakeholders in discussing the findings, and developing the best actions for course correction and for what’s next.
5. Decide on modes of dissemination that allow multiple stakeholders to participate in the sharing.

As Davidson (2012) describes, the most ‘actionable’ evaluations are the ones that follow these six (6) key elements:

1. Clear purpose
2. The right stakeholder engagement strategy
   from the start (including a focus on the participants themselves)
3. Important, big picture questions
4. Well-evidenced, well-reasoned answers
5. Succinct, straight-to-the-point reporting
6. Actionable insights, collaborative problem-solving for moving forward

Ethical Standards & Considerations

A key consideration in developing an evaluation framework and tools is the incorporation of ethical standards for research. Evaluation with integrity is done in ways that:

- respect people, relationships, and service objectives;
- are methodologically responsive and appropriate; and
- are credibly and competently done.1
Some of the main ethical considerations in conducting evaluation are:

- Ethics Board approval to ensure compliance with current ethical standards;
- Informed consent from participants to ensure they are aware and comfortable with the processes involved in the evaluation; and
- Permissions/releases to allow certain types of information to be used for the purposes of evaluation.

### Building Capacity for Evaluation

Performance measurement requires a specific set of skills and resources. The key question becomes: What are we capable of assessing at this stage? Consider the following steps:

- Take into consideration your situation & capacity. Map out your current level of knowledge and comfort with evaluation, skills, and resources. Take this [evaluation self-assessment](http://www.pre.ethics.gc.ca/eng/policy-politique/initiatives/tcps2-eptc2/Default/) to see where your organization is in terms of its evaluation culture, and to start a discussion on how your organization can grow as a learning organization.
- Clarify your evaluation purpose: Why evaluate at this point? What do you want out of your evaluation efforts at this stage?
- Articulate your evaluation questions: What do you want and need to know about your program?
- Determine your indicators: Based on your evaluation purpose, questions, and the desired outcomes and indicators you mapped out in your Logic Model or Theory of Change, determine the type of evaluation you can undertake at this stage (output monitoring, process evaluation, outcome evaluation).
- Develop an action plan around your current evaluation capacity and needs. Explore the resources you need to push your evaluation further, and where to access them.

### Key Resources for Ethical Standards in Research & Evaluation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Resource</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
• Start taking steps implementing your evaluation.¹

Your staff team should be able to collect at least some output and process data internally. Examples include:

• Numbers of mentors and mentees;
• Participants’ satisfaction with training they received;
• Participants’ satisfaction with the mentoring experience as a whole; and
• Whether or not planned activities actually occurred.

Participants can turn in reports on what they did together, what they learned, and suggestions for improvements. You can also get match completion numbers, reflecting how many participants completed their match duration as intended. For other needs, you may have to get outside evaluation help. Someone who specializes in mentoring evaluation can guide you through an outcome evaluation and collect more detailed and candid information from participants. You and your team can strategize with the evaluator on the data needed, items to be asked, tools and procedures, and what you want the report to cover.

Key Resources on Evaluation

Program Evaluation Toolkit by the Ontario Centre of Excellence for Child & Youth Mental Health

Project Evaluation Guide For Non-Profit Organizations: Fundamental Methods & Steps by Imagine Canada

Tools to Establish Evaluation Criteria & Methods by MENTOR, 2015

Data Collection Methods Toolkit by Northwest Center for Public Health Practice

YouthREX – Youth Research and Evaluation Exchange (Ontario), including free, one-on-one support for community organizations in Ontario to track and measure their work

Capacity Canada EvalU including evaluation Boot Camps and coaching

Genuine Evaluation blog with resources on practical evaluation

PerformWell data bank of outcome measures and tools
Below are some of the key resources produced by this project.

**RESOURCES:**

- **Best Practices for Mentoring Youth Facing Barriers to Success**
- **Tools & Resources for Mentoring Youth Facing Barriers to Success**
- **Crossing the Line: Power & Privilege Activity – Facilitator’s Guide**
- **Body Mapping Activity – Facilitator’s Guide** for program planning, tailoring, training, and evaluation

**WEBINARS:**

[http://ontariomentoringcoalition.ca/mentoryouthfacingbarriers/key-resources-webinars/](http://ontariomentoringcoalition.ca/mentoryouthfacingbarriers/key-resources-webinars/)
REFERENCES


Bania, M. (2014). *Striving for sustainability: Six key strategies to guide your efforts*. Ottawa, ON: YOUCAN.


Big Brothers Big Sisters of Fraser Valley. (n.d.). Strengths-based mentoring: Nurturing children and youth to help them thrive! *Big Brothers Big Sisters of Fraser Valley*. Retrieved from [http://www.mentoringworks.ca/site-bbbs/media/FraserValley/Strength-Based_Mentoring.pdf](http://www.mentoringworks.ca/site-bbbs/media/FraserValley/Strength-Based_Mentoring.pdf)


